CVH, All Offenses: Statewide, Sentenced 2019-2023

# **Data Request**

The Minnesota Sentencing Guidelines Commission has a statutory charter to serve as the state's clearinghouse and information center for the collection, preparation, analysis, and dissemination of information on sentencing practices. This data request serves to fulfills this charter. 2

**Information Requested:** Departure data for all CVH offenses.

#### Offense Details:

- Includes CVH offenses
  - o Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH), under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Grossly Negligent Manner, under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(1)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Negligent while under Influence Alcohol, under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(i)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Negligent while under Influence Controlled Substance, under Minn.
     Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(ii)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Negligent while under Influence Cannabis, under Minn. Stat. §
     609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(iii)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Negligent while under Influence Combo Alc/Con. Sub., under Minn.
     Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(iv)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Alcohol Concentration .08 or more, under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(3)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Alcohol Concentration .08 or more within 2 hours, under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(4)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Negligent under Influence of Intoxicating Substance, under Minn.
     Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(5)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Negligent Any Amount Sch. I or II Cont. Substance, under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(6)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Driver Causes Accident & Leaves Scene, under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(7)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Result of Cited Defective Maintenance, under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(8)
  - Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH) Qualified Prior Driving Conviction, under Minn. Stat. § 609.2112
     subd. 1(b)
- Excludes attempts under Minn. Stat. § 609.17 and conspiracies under Minn. Stat. § 609.175.
- All offenses a Severity Level 8 on the Standard Sentencing Grid.
- All offenses have a maximum length of stayed sentence of 10 years, except for Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(b), which has a maximum length of stayed sentence of 15 years.

### **Analysis:**

- Statewide.
- Sentenced 2019-2023.
- Dispositional departure rates by presumptive disposition and criminal history score.
- Durational departure rates by prison sentence and criminal history score.
- Most frequently cited reasons for mitigated departures.
- Prosecutorial agreement for mitigated departures.

Source: MSGC Monitoring Data Page 1 of 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Minn. Stat. § 244.09, subd. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Submit data requests online at <a href="https://mn.gov/sentencing-guidelines/contact/data-requests.jsp">https://mn.gov/sentencing-guidelines/contact/data-requests.jsp</a>

#### Note on Data:

Minnesota Sentencing Guidelines Commission (MSGC) monitoring data are person-based, meaning cases represent persons rather than individual charges. Persons sentenced within the same county in a one-month period are generally counted only once, based on their most serious offense. This data request was prepared by the research staff of MSGC in fulfillment of the Commission's statutory role as a clearinghouse and information center for information on sentencing practices. This is not a policy document. Nothing in this request should be construed as a statement of existing policy or recommendation of future policy on behalf of the Commission itself, or as an authoritative interpretation of the Minnesota Sentencing Guidelines, Minnesota statutes, or case law.

## **Dispositional Departures**

Statewide, from 2019-2023, 170 people were sentenced for Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH), All Offenses, including Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(1), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(i), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(ii), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(ii), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(ii), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(3), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(4), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(5), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(6), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(7), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(8), and § 609.2112 subd. 1(b). None had a presumptive disposition of stay and all 170 (100.0%) had a presumptive disposition of commit.

Among persons with a presumptive commit/prison sentence, 89 (52.4%) were not departures and 81 (47.6%) were mitigated dispositional departures, when the Guidelines recommended a commit/prison sentence, but the court pronounced a stayed sentence.

Table 1. Dispositional Departure Rate by Criminal History Score

CVH, All Offenses: Statewide, Sentenced 2019-2023

		Dispositional Departures <sup>b</sup>							
	All Presumptive				Presumpti	Presumptive Commits f			
	Cases	Dispos	sition <sup>a</sup>	No Departures <sup>d</sup>		Aggravated Departures e			
CHS	Total	Stay	Commit	None	None (Req) g	Agg <sup>g</sup>	Agg (Req)g	None <sup>g</sup>	Mit
0	116	0	116					46	70
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					39.7%	60.3%
1	12	0	12					6	6
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					50.0%	50.0%
2	11	0	11					9	2
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					81.8%	18.2%
3	10	0	10					10	0
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					100.0%	0.0%
4	6	0	6					6	0
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					100.0%	0.0%
5	6	0	6					4	2
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					66.7%	33.3%
6 or	9	0	9					8	1
more	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					88.9%	11.1%
Total	170	0	170					89	81
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					52.4%	47.6%

Source: Minnesota Sentencing Guidelines Commission Monitoring Data. Notes: Percents refer to rows, cases within each group of defendants by criminal history score (CHS).

a. Presumptive Disposition: Guidelines recommended sentence based on offense severity and defendant CHS; either a "Stay" a stayed/non-prison sentence; or "Commit" a commit/prison sentence.

b. Dispositional Departures: when the court pronounced a sentenced that was different from the presumptive sentence provided by the Guidelines.

c. Among Presumptive Stays: Dispositional departures among only presumptive stayed sentences; only aggravated dispositional departures are possible for presumptive stays.

d. No Departures: includes "None", no departure, and "None (Req)", where the defendant used their right to demand/request execution of their prison sentence even when the presumptive sentence was stay and the court pronounced a stayed sentence; for offenses on or after 8/1/2015 the Guidelines no longer deemed these cases to be departures. See Guidelines § 2.D.1.

e. Aggravated Departures: includes "Agg", an aggravated dispositional departure, where the Court pronounced a commit sentence (prison) but the Guidelines recommended a stayed sentence (non-prison), and "Agg (Req)" an aggravated dispositional departure, where the defendant used their right to demand/request execution of their prison sentence even when the presumptive sentence was stay and the court pronounced a stayed sentence; for offenses before 8/1/2015 the Guidelines deemed these cases to be departures. See Guidelines § 2.D.1.

f. Among Presumptive Commits: Dispositional departures among only presumptive commit sentences; includes "None", no departure, and "Mit", a mitigated dispositional departure when the Court pronounced a stayed sentence (non-prison) when the Guidelines recommended a commit sentence (prison); only mitigated dispositional departures are possible for presumptive commits.

g. The total number of defendants who received a prison sentence is a combination of presumptive stayed sentences which demanded a prison sentence, "None (Req)", and who received an aggravated dispositional departure, "Agg" or "Agg (Req)", as well as presumptive commits which did not receive a mitigated departure, "None".

### CVH, All Offenses: Statewide, Sentenced 2019-2023

The most common reasons cited<sup>3</sup> among the 81 mitigated dispositional departures were amenable to probation (62; 76.5%), shows remorse/accepts responsibility (46; 56.8%), and amenable to treatment (24; 29.6%).

**Table 2. Reasons Provided for Mitigated Dispositional Departures** 

CVH, All Offenses: Statewide, Sentenced 2019-2023

Reasons Provided for Mitigated Dispositional Departure <sup>a</sup>	Number	Percent <sup>b</sup>
Amenable to probation	62	76.5%
Shows remorse/accepts responsibility	46	56.8%
Amenable to treatment	24	29.6%
Compliance with probation/extended supervision	15	18.5%
Virtually all parties/vict/family agreed on sentence	14	17.3%
Recommended by court services	13	16.0%
Imposed rest. or other financial penalty/ensure paid	4	4.9%
Age of offender	4	4.9%
Unknown	4	4.9%
Prevent trauma to victim from testifying	3	3.7%
Less onerous/weapon type less serious/gun not loaded	2	2.5%
No prior record/no prior felonies	2	2.5%
Cooperated with police and other law enforcement	2	2.5%
Accept sentence plea due to evidentiary problems	2	2.5%
Lacked substantial capacity for judgment (non-drug)	1	1.2%
Mit or excuse culpability, not amount to defense	1	1.2%
Revoked EJJ	1	1.2%
Cooperated with court services	1	1.2%
Sentence appropriate/just	1	1.2%
Defendants health problems	1	1.2%
Save taxpayers cost of a trial/judicial efficiency	1	1.2%
Total Cases	81	

Source: Minnesota Sentencing Guidelines Commission Monitoring Data.

Notes: Percents refer to the proportion of mitigated dispositional departures receiving each reason.

The prosecutor agreed to/recommended/ did not object to the departure in 47 (58.0%) cases, objected to the departure in 17 (21.0%) cases, and in 17 (21.0%) cases the position of the prosecutor was unknown.

Source: MSGC Monitoring Data Data Request Page 3 of 4

a. Mitigated Dispositional Departures: When the Court pronounced a stayed sentence (non-prison) when the Guidelines recommended a commit sentence (prison);

mitigated dispositional departures are only possible for presumptive commits.

b. Percent: Since each sentence may receive multiple reasons, combined percents may not add up to 100.0%.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The court may provide multiple reasons for mitigated dispositional departures; percents may not add up to 100.0%.

## **Durational Departures**

Statewide, from 2019-2023, among people sentenced for Criminal Vehicular Homicide (CVH), All Offenses, including Minn. Stat. § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(1), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(i), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(ii), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(ii), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(2)(ii), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(3), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(4), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(5), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(6), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(7), § 609.2112 subd. 1(a)(8), and § 609.2112 subd. 1(b), in total, 89 (52.4%) people received a prison sentence<sup>4</sup>, and 81 (47.6%) people received a non-prison sentence.

Of the people that received a non-prison sentence, 80 (98.8%) were not departures, 1 (1.2%) received an aggravated durational departure, none received a mitigated durational departure, and none received a mitigated departure to a misdemeanor/gross misdemeanor sentence.

Of the people that received prison, 79 (88.8%) were not departures, 3 (3.4%) received an aggravated durational departure, and 7 (7.9%) received a mitigated durational departure.

**Table 3. Durational Departure Rate by Criminal History Score** 

CVH, All Offenses: Statewide, Sentenced 2019-2023

	All	Executed	d Prison	Durational Departures <sup>b</sup>						
	Cases	Sentence <sup>a</sup>		Non-Prison Sentences <sup>c</sup>				Prison Sentence d		
CHS	Total	No	Yes	None	Agg	Mit	Misd/GM	None	Agg	Mit
0	116	70	46	69	1	0	0	43	1	2
	100.0%	60.3%	39.7%	98.6%	1.4%	0.0%	0.0%	93.5%	2.2%	4.3%
1	12	6	6	6	0	0	0	5	1	0
	100.0%	50.0%	50.0%	100.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	83.3%	16.7%	0.0%
2	11	2	9	2	0	0	0	8	0	1
	100.0%	18.2%	81.8%	100.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	88.9%	0.0%	11.1%
3	10	0	10					9	0	1
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					90.0%	0.0%	10.0%
4	6	0	6					4	1	1
	100.0%	0.0%	100.0%					66.7%	16.7%	16.7%
5	6	2	4	2	0	0	0	4	0	0
	100.0%	33.3%	66.7%	100.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	100.0%	0.0%	0.0%
6 or	9	1	8	1	0	0	0	6	0	2
more	100.0%	11.1%	88.9%	100.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	75.0%	0.0%	25.0%
Total	170	81	89	80	1	0	0	79	3	7
	100.0%	47.6%	52.4%	98.8%	1.2%	0.0%	0.0%	88.8%	3.4%	7.9%

Source: Minnesota Sentencing Guidelines Commission Monitoring Data. Notes: Percents refer to rows, cases within each group of defendants by criminal history score (CHS).

The reasons<sup>5</sup> cited among the 7 mitigated durational departures among prison sentences were crime less onerous (3; 42.9%), inadvertent departure/worksheet error (3; 42.9%), shows remorse/accepts responsibility (2; 28.6%), cooperated with police and other law enforcement (1; 14.3%), and "departure information not available" (1; 14.3%). The prosecutor agreed to/recommended/ did not object to the departure in 3 (42.9%) cases, objected to the departure in none of the cases, and in 4 (57.1%) cases the position of the prosecutor was unknown.

a. Executed Prison Sentence: the pronounced disposition from the Court, either "No," a non-prison sentence (stayed), or "Yes," a prison sentence (commit; regardless of the Guidelines recommendation). b. Durational Departures: when the Court pronounced a sentence duration that is different from the recommended duration provided by the Guidelines; either more or less than the fixed duration for presumptive stays, or outside of the duration range (15% lower and 20% higher) for presumptive commits, provided the minimum sentence is not less than one year and the maximum sentence is not more than the statutory maximum (See section 2.C.1-2).

c. Non-Prison Sentences: among non-prison sentences, "None" the pronounced non-prison sentence length from the Court matched the length recommended by the Guidelines; "Agg" an aggravated durational departure for a non-prison sentence when the pronounced non-prison sentence was more than the fixed duration for a presumptive stay or more than 20% higher than the fixed duration for a presumptive commit sentence; "Mit" a mitigated durational departure for a non-prison sentence was less than the fixed duration for a presumptive stay or more than 15% lower than the fixed duration for a presumptive commit sentence; "Misd/GM" a mitigated durational departure where the Court imposed a misdemeanor or gross misdemeanor sentence for a felony-level conviction, meaning up to 364 days of confinement in a local jail or other non-jail sanctions can be imposed as a condition of probation.

d. **Prison Sentence**: Among prison sentences, "None" the pronounced prison sentence length from the Court matched the length recommended by the Guidelines; "Agg" an aggravated durational departure for a prison sentence when the pronounced prison sentence was more than the fixed duration for a presumptive stay or more than 20% higher than the fixed duration for a presumptive commit sentence; "Mit" a mitigated durational departure for a prison sentence when the pronounced prison sentence was less than the fixed duration for a presumptive stay or more than 15% lower than the fixed duration for a presumptive commit sentence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The total number of defendants that received a prison includes the following: persons who demanded execution of sentence where it was not considered an aggravated dispositional departure, all aggravated dispositional departures among presumptive stays, and non-departures among presumptive commits.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The court may provide multiple reasons for prison sentences receiving mitigated durational departures; percents may not add up to 100.0%.