



Minnesota Board of Teaching

Minnesota Department of Education MDE CC-13 January 8, 2016

Minutes

Board members present: J. Grabowska, E. Azer, L. Woelber, MF Clardy, J. Barnhill, J. Baumann, L. Covington-Clarkson, J. Bellingham, A. Krafthefer, and LA Stephens

Board members absent: D. O'Brien

I. Call to Order

The January 8, 2016 Minnesota Board of Teaching meeting was called to order by Chair, J. Bellingham, at 9:06 a.m. in Conference Center A, Room 13, at the Minnesota Department of Education. A quorum was present.

II. Business Meeting

- A. Approval of Agenda: J. Grabowska moved approval of the agenda with extreme flexibility. J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.
- B. Consent Agenda: J. Grabowska moved to approve the Consent Agenda. MF Clardy seconded the motion. The motion passed.
 - 1. Minutes of the December 11, 2015 Meeting
 - 2. Waiver Requests

School	Individual	Program
Brainerd - ALC	Mary Miller	Experimental Program
"	Christina Lundgren	Experimental Program
Brainerd - High Risk Student Transition	Erin Litzinger	Experimental Program
Fergus Falls - ALC	Ethan Johnson	Experimental Program
Fridley - Project Lead the Way	James Hron	Experimental Program
Great Expectations - Interdisciplinary and Project Lead the Way	Katheryn Nelson – Pederson	Experimental Program
"	Erik Hahn	Experimental Program
Inver Grove Heights - ALP	Katherine Martin	Experimental Program

School	Individual	Program
Minneapolis - Care and Treatment Center & Contract Alternative	Robyn Connelly	Experimental Program
"	Kelly Pribyl	Experimental Program
"	Christina Ashford	Experimental Program
"	Sarah Olson	Experimental Program
"	Christy Hicks	Experimental Program
"	Kevin Scharber	Experimental Program
Pequot Lakes - STEM and Project Lead the Way	Nathaniel Novak	Experimental Program
Region 6 & 8 SW/WC Service Cooperative - ALC	Jessica Shores	Experimental Program
River Bend Ed District - ALC	Breanna Olson	Experimental Program
Rochester Off Campus - Project Based Learning	Laurie Windish	Experimental Program
Runestone - ALC	James Duberowski	Experimental Program
St. Paul - Care and Treatment Center	Max Cmo	Experimental Program
St. Paul	Youa Lee	Hmong Language

3. Program Approvals:

a. Unit Approval:

The Board approved Full Continuing Approval to the University of Minnesota: Morris to offer teacher licensure programs through June 30, 2022.

b. Program Discontinuation:

The Board disapproved St. Cloud State University's Teacher Licensure Programs for K-12 World Languages/French & German Language Programs.

c. Request for Initial Program Approval (RIPA):

The Board granted approval to the following new programs:

University of St. Catherine- approval through June 30, 2017		
Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.3200	Teachers of Elementary Education with emphasis in Montessori Education NONCONVENTIONAL program	Baccalaureate

Southwest Minnesota State University- approval through June 30, 2017		
Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.4725	Teachers of Reading	Post Baccalaureate

d. Full Program Approval (PERCA):

The Board granted approval through June 30, 2018 to the following program(s). Approval beyond June 30, 2018 is contingent on meeting program approval requirements via submitted Program Effectiveness Reports for Continuing Approval (PERCA).

Hamline University- approval through June 30, 2018		
Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.4800	Teachers of Social Studies grades 5-12	Post baccalaureate
8710.4800	Teachers of Social Studies grades 5-12	Baccalaureate

Concordia St Paul- approval through June 30, 2018		
Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.5850	Teachers of Special Education: Autism Spectrum Disorders	Post baccalaureate

Winona State University- approval through June 30, 2018		
Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.4250	Teachers of Communication Arts and Literature grades 5-12	Baccalaureate
8710.4800	Teachers of Social Studies grades 5-12	Baccalaureate
8710.4800	Teachers of Social Studies 5-12	Baccalaureate
8710.4950	Teachers of World Languages and Cultures: Spanish K-12	Baccalaureate
8710.4800	Teachers of Social Studies: Teacher Preparation Collaborative Internship Program with Rochester Schools	Post baccalaureate
8710.4200	Teachers of Business Education: Teacher Preparation Collaborative Internship Program with Rochester Schools	Post baccalaureate
8710.4600	Teachers of Mathematics Teacher Preparation Collaborative Internship Program with Rochester Schools	Post baccalaureate
8710.4750	Teachers of Physics: Teacher Preparation Collaborative Internship Program with Rochester Schools	Post baccalaureate

8710.4750	Teachers of Chemistry: Teacher Preparation Collaborative Internship Program with Rochester Schools	Post baccalaureate
8710.4750	Teachers of Earth and Space: Teacher Preparation Collaborative Internship Program with Rochester Schools	Post baccalaureate
8710.4750	Teachers of Life: Teacher Preparation Collaborative Internship Program with Rochester Schools	Post baccalaureate

University of Minnesota, Duluth- approval through June 30, 2018		
Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.3310	Middle Level Endorsement: Communication Arts 5-8	Post baccalaureate
8710.3320	Middle Level Endorsement: Mathematics 5-8	Post baccalaureate
8710.3330	Middle Level Endorsement: Social Studies 5-8	Post baccalaureate
8710.3340	Middle Level Endorsement: General Science 5-8	Post baccalaureate

C. Nonlicensed Community Expert Requests: GROUP I – First Time Community Experts

School	Individual	Course(s)
Achieve Language Academy	Linnea Wier	Spanish Language K-8
Aspen Academy	Race Mochridhe	Learning Disabilities K-12
Chisholm	Sheryle Cuffe	Medical Careers 7-12
El Colegio Charter	Luby Roberta	Academic and Behavioral Strategist K-12
Global Academy	Manal Al-zeir	Arabic Language K-8
ISD 287	Lauren Yurek	Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12
"	Diana Lundeen-Hornung	Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12
Marshall	Ellen Helgersen	Spanish Language K-8
Minneapolis	Monique Wiley	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12 and Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12
"	Norma Romero - Rodriguez	Elementary Education Immersion K-6
"	Nora Ulseth	Developmental Disabilities K-12

School	Individual	Course(s)
Minnesota Internship Center	Sophie Dennison	Self-contained Classroom - Visual Arts K-12, Spanish Language K-12, Communication Arts and Lit 5-12, Math 5-12, Technology 5-12, Social Studies 5-12, and Life Science 9-12
Osseo	Andrew Kavanagh	Transportation Careers 7-12
Region 6 & 8 SW/WC Coop	Michelle Whitcomb-Johnson	Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12 and Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
St. Cloud	Sherri Rademacher	American Sign Language K-12
"	Todd Corrow	Academic and Behavioral Strategist K-12
"	Jennifer Dilts	Academic and Behavioral Strategist K-12
St. Paul	Matthew Hellendrung	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
St. Paul Conservatory Performing Art	Keely Wolter	Theatre K-12
"	Rosy Simas	Dance K-12
"	Douglas Little	Instrumental and Classroom Music K-12
"	Erik Pergrine	Vocal and Classroom Music K-12
"	Djenane Saint Juste	Dance K-12
Technical Academies of Minnesota	David Itrone	Physical Education K-12 and Communication Arts and Lit 5-12 and Social Studies 5-12

MF Clardy made a motion to approve the First Time Community Experts with the exception of Minnesota Internship Center (Sophie Dennison), Technical Academies of Minnesota (David Itrone) and Chisholm (Sheryle Cuffe). J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve the First Time Community Expert, Sheryle Cuffe (Chisholm) J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve the First Time Community Expert, Sophie Dennison (Minnesota Internship Center). LA Stephens seconded the motion. The motion passed with a nay vote from A. Krafthefer, LA Stephens, and Chair Bellingham.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve the First time Community Expert, David Itrone (Technical Academies of Minnesota). J. Baumann seconded the motion. Sara Baird from the Technical Academies of Minnesota provided clarification to questions from Board members. The motion passed.

2. Nonlicensed Community Experts: Group II -- Renewals/Repeats

School	Individual	Course(s)
Academia Cesar Chavez	Rosario Preciado	Elementary Education Immersion K-6
Brainerd	Jody Converse	American Sign Language K-12
ISD 287	Joshua Navarrete	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
"	Jeremy Bauernfeind	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
Minneapolis	Amanda Sandoval	Bilingual Education and Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Kirstin Buckley	Bilingual Education and Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
North Branch	Christopher Edington	JROTC Program 9-12
"	Stephen Kornitzer	JROTC Program 9-12
St. Paul Conservatory Performing Art	Signe Harriday	Theatre K-12

E. Azer made a motion to approve the Group II – Repeat/Renewal Community Expert requests with the exception of Rosario Preciado (Academia Cesar Chavez) . J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

L. Woelber made a motion to approve Repeat/Renewal Community Expert request for Rosario Preciado (Academia Cesar Chavez). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

D. Discretionary Variance Requests – January 2016

District	Individual	Licensure
Belle Plaine	Diane Tye	Developmental Disabilities 3-12
El Colegio Charter	Tamera Ramirez	Spanish 9-12
Hendricks	Nancy Olson	Early Childhood Special Education B-Age 6
Prior Lake-Savage	Stephanie Orfei	School Social Worker K-5
Stephen - Argyle Central	Brittney Lindgren	Speech Language Pathologist K-6
Verndale	Tracy Hegarty	Physics 9-12

Requests for Tamera Ramirez (El Colegio Charter) and Tracy Hegarty (Verndale) were removed from the list.

J. Baumann made a motion to approve the Discretionary Variance Request for Diane Tye (Belle Plaine). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

MF. Clardy made a motion to approve the Discretionary Variance Request for Nancy Olson (Hendricks). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Baumann made a motion to approve the Discretionary Variance Request for Stephanie

Orfei (Prior Lake-Savage). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

MF. Clardy made a motion to approve the Discretionary Variance Request for Brittney Lindgren (Stephen - Argyle Central). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Dr. Susan Johnson, Assistant Dean in the School of Education at the University of Northwestern-St. Paul, addressed their Discretionary Variance Request to waive Rule 8705.1000 subpart 8.1, for 15 year veteran faculty member, Ms. Deborah Schneidermann who does not have a master's degree and supervises student teachers to continue in her position. J. Grabowska made a motion to approve the request. L. Woelber seconded the motion. The motion passed.

- E. Public Comment - Individuals wishing to address the Board must sign up prior to the Call to Order and may speak for 3-5 minutes.

Joan Breslin-Larson, Supervisor in Special Education at MDE:

Ms. Breslin-Larson addressed the teacher shortage relative to extending teacher licensure for out-of-state candidates. She noted they are aware of the shortage and encourage increased awareness for appropriate and high standards for all teacher candidates. Additional coursework is often required to teach students with special needs in specific age ranges and a test alone cannot address the needs of students. She suggested the Board consider issuing limited licenses as well as opportunities to acquire additional coursework to meet requirements.

Sara Ford from Education MN:

"My name is Sara Ford, and I work in the policy, research, and outreach department at Education Minnesota. We applaud the board's efforts to streamline the language and processes around licensure for out-of-state candidates, and we appreciate the board's attention to teacher qualifications.

We are painfully aware of the teacher shortage in particular fields. We know that the teacher shortage in specific fields is real, and we see evidence of that in MDE's Supply and Demand report, in the applications for variances and community expert waivers, and in the stories our members share. We know, too, that the shortages described in the Supply and Demand report echo national trends. And we are acutely aware that our teaching force lacks the diversity it needs if it is to come anywhere close to reflecting the diversity of our student body, and that this is a problem that deserves and requires all of our work and attention.

We know, too, that existing procedures for candidates from other states seeking MN licensure are confusing and need streamlining, as new statute dictates.

In terms of the specific proposal, we agree with what some others have already said in the following areas:

- We agree that we need better and more transparent language around the determination of "similar content field" and "similar license field."
- We agree that it would be helpful to include language that clarifies the requirements around the basic skills test for non-native English speakers.

- We agree the proposal should include language for applicants otherwise qualified who have not yet passed basic skills in subpart 4.

That said, we want to offer some context for the current focus on teacher licensure rules. There is a tremendous amount of attention being paid to the licensure process right now, and we agree that the process should be as transparent and streamlined as possible. We agree that the board needs to both make sure its requirements are fair, free of bias, and necessary, and that those requirements ensure that the teachers in Minnesota schools have the training and education they need to be successful in our classrooms.

What concerns us is that the teacher shortage gets reduced in policy conversations to the level of licensure requirements. As I've said, we think those need to be carefully established, and we appreciate the work you are putting into this process right now. But we remind the board and stakeholders that the problem of a teacher shortage in specific fields and the shortage of teachers of color in Minnesota is not solely or even mostly a problem of teacher licensing requirements. If you listen to some of the rhetoric around this, you might conclude that the only reason districts are having a hard time staffing classrooms with qualified teachers is that the BOT has made it too difficult to become a teacher. And that kind of distortion is deeply concerning to us.

So let me point out a few facts. Enrollments in our teacher preparation institution programs are dramatically down over the past 20 years. And one third of Minnesota's licensed teachers leave their jobs within the first five years. One third. These are people who have spent years and incurred high levels of student debt in their quests to become teachers.

Special education teachers are incredibly difficult to find. They also leave at very high rates. I met a special education teacher in Faribault in December who started as a paraprofessional in special education. She loved the work. She thought she could be more effective if she became a licensed teacher, and so she enrolled in a program and completed her licensure requirements while continuing to earn a living as a paraprofessional. Now she is a special ed teacher carrying thousands of dollars of student debt, and she is very clear about one thing: she said to me, "now that I am the teacher, I spend most of my time doing paperwork rather than helping kids. I really miss the kids. I sometimes wish I'd stayed at my old job. Then I'd get to help kids more of the time and I wouldn't have all of this debt."

Teachers of color who are vastly underrepresented in the profession are also leaving it at a higher rates nationwide than white teachers, a trend that began roughly 26 years ago (it used to be the reverse) and that has continued to widen ever since.

My point is, serious conversations seeking solutions to Minnesota's teacher shortage problem will have to dig much, much deeper than teacher licensure requirements. Even if we get licensure requirements right—we require only that which is necessary and offer a clear and transparent, easy-to-understand and to follow process—we will still have districts that cannot find enough teachers in specific fields, we will still have districts who can't find substitute teachers, and we will still have a teaching force that fails to reflect the diversity of our students. And it is likely true that some stakeholders will continue to imply that the teaching shortage is something that, somehow, lands squarely on your shoulders.

We applaud the board for taking care to get these rules right, for maintaining high standards for Minnesota teachers and for finding ways to clarify the process of becoming a Minnesota teacher. But we also hope that we can keep in mind that this is just one piece in a large and complex puzzle that deserves and requires robust, committed work from all of us.”

Chair Bellingham thanked her for comments.

At 10:04 a.m., Chair Bellingham issued a 10 minute recess.

III. Unfinished Business

A. Review of NCTQ – Report and Recommendations

Erin Doan presented recommendations from the National Council on Teacher Quality (NCTQ) 2015 Minnesota Teacher Policy report (see BOT website). Minnesota received a grade of C-, up from a previous grade of D-, with improvements in licensure and testing. Each state covers goals areas with specific grades and recommendations, noting a grade is as not as important as the criticisms are. This report points out shared responsibility of the BOT and MDE and requires a joint effort to respond.

B. Rulemaking Update

Erin Doan referred to the rulemaking working draft (distributed handout and posted on the BOT website) that was discussed line by line at the afternoon work session following the general meeting. Many stakeholders have been entering the process to address evidence from out-of-state candidates looking at how do we look at a structure that allows for things, and how have rules changed are part of the process. We were aiming to have a full draft in place prior to comments, but learned in October a draft in rule was prepared. We wrote the rule draft that reflected the rule requirements for Board members to review and consider the starting point for Minnesota teachers and for out-of-state candidates, to make recommendations for a licensed/experienced teacher to become licensed in Minnesota.

The request for comment period, beginning of November through January, is available on the BOT website. The January 1st deadline for comments was set by the legislature. We felt it was ambitious, but we are moving due haste to assume comments are submitted.

After today, stakeholders are encouraged to make suggestions, ask questions, and submit edits to the draft. After today, the draft will be sent to the Revisor’s office. The sonar will be written with the draft, then submitted for approval from the governor’s office, then the hearing. We will be addressing the subject of expanding restricted licenses by taking an exam during rulemaking, not separately and including it in the draft.

IV. New Business

A. 2016 Legislative Priorities

J. Barnhill, co-chair of the Legislative Committee presented the 2016 Legislative Priorities. He added that this list does not reflect all of the issues to be addressed but with a short legislative session starting in March, these are the most critical areas.

2016 Legislative Priorities

The Board of Teaching has provided leadership in initial and ongoing teacher education over the course of the last 40 years, by establishing and maintaining licensure standards and requirements, approving institutions, alternative providers and licensure programs to prepare highly effective educators, and by establishing and enforcing the Code of Ethics for Minnesota teachers.

Adopt Policies Focused on Teacher Supply and Demand

The Minnesota Board of Teaching is committed to:

- Facilitating an **increase in alternative preparation pathways** while maintaining consistent expectations for the granting of a full professional Minnesota teaching license
 - New pathways for education support professionals to become licensed teachers.
 - Perform targeted outreach to 2 year institutions of Higher Learning to create new preparation options
- Collaborating with Minnesota education stakeholder groups for unified research of effective teaching practices.

Legislative assistance is needed to:

- Provide ongoing supplemental funding to ensure one **centralized statewide job bank** for teachers in Minnesota via Saint Cloud State University's EdPost website.
- Create **grant opportunities for teacher candidates** to encourage teaching in geographically remote areas of the state and to diversify the teacher workforce.

Invest in Infrastructure to Ensure Teacher Quality

The Minnesota Board of Teaching is committed to:

- Leading collaboration with NASDTEC member states to **ensure the mobility of licensed teachers.**
- Collaborating with MDE to support **equity of access to licensed teachers** for all students.

Legislative assistance is needed to:

- **Increase Board of Teaching funding** to provide staffing and IT resources necessary for innovation beyond basic regulatory functions and a truly independent professional standards board.
- Provide resources for **the licensure via portfolio** application and review process
- Restore Equal Access to Teacher **Mentoring and Induction Statewide**
Fund evidence-based mentoring and induction programs to address multiple factors critical to student learning:
 - Personalized professional development
 - Timely and actionable feedback on teaching
 - Improved teaching and learning conditions
 - **Recruitment and retention of teachers of color** to reflect the demographics of our changing student population.
 - **Retention** of current licensed Minnesota teachers

Clarify Licensure Policies

The Minnesota Board of Teaching is committed to:

- Supporting the use of college entrance exams as a measure of basic skills to reduce the financial burden of standardized testing (ACT, SAT, GRE) on teacher candidates.

- Implementing policies for teacher licensure renewal that recognize educators for the pursuit of targeted professional development that enhances their instructional skills and content knowledge, including National Board Certification.

Legislative assistance is needed to:

- Initiate recodification of licensure statutes and rules by the Office of the Revisor and the Board of Teaching to further streamline the licensing process.
- Review statutes and rules for alignment to current research based recommendations regarding effective teaching.
- Restructure renewal requirements from a clock hour based system to allow for targeted professional development that is tied to identified needs for growth.

E. Doan noted that there is a need to refine language in statute and rule to better understand teacher effectiveness. J. Grabowska noted we were assured there is bipartisan support to clarify licensure statutes and rules. We have invited legislators and their representatives in the ongoing conversations to do so.

The Board approved a motion by the Legislative Committee to adopt the 2016 Legislative Priorities.

Chair Bellingham thanked the committee for their work on compiling these priorities. He added the Board appreciates staff members and legislative representatives who have attended meetings to address these important issues.

V. Reports

A. Minnesota Department of Education

Nels Onstad, Educator Licensing Executive Director, provided an update on the Portfolio process. He thanked the Board and all stakeholders who have a genuine interest for students in Minnesota. Portfolio has been open since the first week of December, accepting eligibility forms, letters of intent, and since then a dozen applications has grown into the mid-50s within the last 3 weeks. January 22 is the last day for his staff to accept eligibility forms for the 30-day minimum window. The application submission window has been extended to February 29th, providing two additional weeks. There will be additional windows to submit applications via Portfolio in 2016 that will be coordinated with the job market rush later in the year and dates will be posted.

Mr. Onstad asked the Board for assistance with clarification of standards in statute and rule; particularly with knowledge base in content and effective teacher practice. The guidelines are there, but clarification is needed in language regarding knowledge/content without significant coursework or experience in teacher practice. Candidates must have a BA GPA of 2.5 in content area; some have a BA outside of their area and some have significant experience with special permission. Candidate must demonstrate proficiency in those areas and if they can, could be considered in Portfolio. He added the need for conversation around CTE requirements to demonstrate content area knowledge (such as Ag); some are experts, but have not pursued a BA, and yet have significant experience. If a candidate already holds a license, it could be less involved to prove demonstrated experience, if they want to teach in another area.

Applicants receive feedback and can resubmit at any time (one time), and Educator Licensing has 60 days to respond.

Chair Bellingham thanked Mr. Onstad for the report.

B. Staff

Alex Liuzzi, BOT Teacher Education Specialist, reported that the Program Review Panel (PRP) will have their first meeting on February 4th to review all flagged programs, including looking at program data, per new PERCA rules, effective January 1, 2016. The panel consists of 13 members with representation from MACTE, EdMinn, the Board, alternative pathways, and MDE.

Erin Doan reported that following mid-year budget conversations with MDE, we will be facing tough decisions. All MDE divisions are experiencing budget concerns due to drastic salary/fringe/staffing changes based on contract negotiations. Infrastructure areas we need to monitor will be new program reviews, site visits, rulemaking, as well as mileage and hotel costs for board members.

C. Chair

Chair Bellingham reported that per the By-Laws, he will soon be appointing committees and committee chairs and to let him know if interested.

He thanked everyone for their hard work, including staff members and the public.

At 11:10 a.m., J. Grabowska moved to go into closed session. L. Woelber seconded the motion. The motion passed.

VI. Closed Session for Licensure Matters

J. Baumann made a motion to appoint L. Clarkson as acting chair. J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska moved that the Board of Teaching approve the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and Order denying the licensure application of Christine M. Demar. MF Clardy seconded the motion. The motion passed. A. Krafthefer and Chair Bellingham abstained.

J. Grabowska moved that the Board of Teaching approve the Stipulation Agreement and Consent Order between Danielle Delores Munoz and the Board of Teaching. MF Clardy seconded the motion. The motion passed. A. Krafthefer and Chair Bellingham abstained.

L. Woelber made a motion to return to Chair Bellingham as acting chair. J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Baumann moved the Board return to open session. J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

VII. Adjourn

Chair Bellingham announced Board action from Closed Session as follows:

- The Board adopted an Order denying the licensure application of Christine M. Demar.
- The Board adopted a Stipulation Agreement and Consent Order regarding the teaching

licenses of Danielle Dolores Munoz.

- The Board approved moving forward with an appeal of the Hernandez vs. Board of Teaching decision.

J. Baumann moved to adjourn the meeting. J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed and the meeting ended at 11:56 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lori Rosenthal, Recorder

Next meeting: Friday, February 12, 2016 at 9:00 a.m., MDE Conference Center A – Room 13