



Great Start for All Minnesota Children Task Force

Working Group Meeting #3: Workforce

April 13, 2022

Welcome!

Here are our virtual meeting protocols



- **Please be on video** as much as possible to help with overall engagement
- **Mute self** when not speaking
- Use **Chat feature** or **“raise hand” button** for questions or comments
- Technical issues can happen to anyone – **chat privately to Hannah Quinn for any needs**
- If you are experiencing an unstable connection - **switch to phone call or close other applications**
- Members of the **public can submit written feedback to** greatstart.taskforce.mmb@state.mn.us

Reminder: Norms & Expectations

- **Members attend meetings prepared and on time**
- **Engage in respectful dialogue**
 - Everyone's input is important
 - Assume best intent
 - Listen with an open mind, and for commonalities
 - Don't say or type anything you wouldn't want to have shared in public
- **Be actively engaged**
 - Don't just disagree, offer a doable alternative idea
 - Speak to the point on the floor
 - Apply your expertise and networks
- **Confirm decisions as we go**
 - Strike a balance between gathering input and moving forward



Protocols to ensure effective discussion

It is critical we use our very limited time together on topic.

- If conversation is **irrelevant to the topic at hand or becoming too narrow** for the scope of our work, *we will redirect with a gentle reminder of the topic at hand.*
- If conversation moves to **points already agreed to by the Task Force**, *we will redirect with a gentle reminder that the topic has been addressed.*

It is critical that all perspectives are heard.

- Please help us in ensuring all Task Force members have time in meetings to share their voice and input. *If you find you are speaking up often, pause to allow space for others.*
- Please let us know if you find it challenging, for any reason, to share your perspectives in our Task Force meetings.
- Reminder there are other opportunities to provide input outside of two-hour meetings, including 1:1 discussions with Task Force leadership, and by providing written input. Requests for individual time and any written input can be provided to greatstart.taskforce.mmb@state.mn.us.

Our Equity Commitments

In all our conversations, we will strive to:

- **Center children and families**
- Pay **particular focus to the needs and priorities** of historically disenfranchised children and families and their communities
- Specifically contemplate **how our decisions may benefit or harm** historically disenfranchised children and families and their communities
- Seek the **expertise and input from stakeholders** already doing the work in historically disenfranchised communities
- Where possible, consider **data that provides insight** into the relative impact on historically disenfranchised children and families and their communities

Revised Guiding Principles

Guiding Principles reflect the Task Force's values and beliefs, guide how it operates, and lay a foundation for decision-making

Promote Equity	Prioritize Family Perspectives, Needs, and Choices	Support the Power of Local Communities	Build Upon our Solid Foundation	Uplift and Diversify the ECE Workforce	Recognize Implementation Realities	Expect High Quality & Effectiveness	Design for Stability, Sustainability, and Positive Impact
<p>We will prioritize a system that promotes equitable outcomes, with a specific focus on children of color and building cultural competency in ECE classrooms.</p>	<p>We will prioritize families' perspectives, needs, and choices as we make data driven and evidence informed recommendations, recognizing that all provider types and settings provide value to the system.</p>	<p>We will ensure local communities are able to define their own priorities and are supported to build the system that meets their children and families' needs.</p>	<p>We will build upon the successes of Minnesota's past and current system, lessons from other states, and the expertise and research in the field.</p>	<p>We will invest in our dedicated and capable early childhood professionals so that they have the opportunity to thrive and grow, and we will build and support a racially diverse workforce.</p>	<p>We will recognize inherent system constraints while remaining responsive to local, state, and federal landscape changes.</p>	<p>We will endeavor to create a high quality and effective ECE system that meets the needs of all of Minnesota's children and families, regardless of circumstance, knowing that the state's future workforce, economy, and resident welfare is dependent upon it</p>	<p>We will work to support funding stability for providers, educators, and staff across mixed delivery settings to ensure better service for families.</p>

Welcome & Agenda



Understand the current landscape of compensation recommendations



Revisit and review financial compensation



Discuss non-financial compensation

Working Group Meeting #3 Agenda – 2 hours

- 6:00 – 6:10 p.m.** Welcome and Logistics
- 6:10 – 6:25 p.m.** Current Landscape of Compensation Recommendations
- 6:25 – 7:00 p.m.** Financial Compensation
 - Recap of Meeting #2: Revisit Wage-Scale Proposal
 - Align on the direction of initial recommendations
- 7:00 – 7:45 p.m.** Non-Wage Compensation | Discussion & Brainstorm
- 7:45 – 8:00 p.m.** Next Steps

Our Working Group Charge

Define what a “qualified, diverse, supported, and equitably compensated” ECE workforce in Minnesota looks like and how it can be achieved.



What We Must Consider

Per the Legislation

Qualified

Develop affordable, accessible, and aligned pathways to support early childhood educators' career and educational advancement

Diverse

Increase racial and ethnic equity and diversity in the early care and education workforce and recognize the value of cultural competency and multilingualism

Supported

Consider the need for and development of a mechanism that ties childcare reimbursement rates to employee compensation

Equitably Compensated

Include a compensation framework that supports recruitment and retention of a qualified workforce in every early care and education setting

Set compensation for early childhood educators by reference to compensation for elementary school teachers

Consider the recommendations from previous work including the Transforming Minnesota's Early Childhood Workforce project and other statewide reports on systemic issues in early care and education

Two Forms of Compensation

Equitably Compensated

Include a compensation framework that supports recruitment and retention of a qualified workforce in every early care and education setting

Set compensation for early childhood educators by reference to compensation for elementary school teachers



Financial Compensation



Non-Wage Compensation (Benefits)

Current Landscape of Compensation Recommendations

Most Proposed ECE Compensation Strategies are Incremental

Most of the strategies:

- Are incremental and typically do not yield a living or middle-class wage
- Not incorporated into the regular paycheck for the educator
- Limited to certain segments of the childcare market (i.e. focused on staff in one age band; categories of personnel; staff who are pursuing credentials)

Strategies fall into the following categories:

- Wage scales, plans & guidelines
- Stipends, supplements & bonus payments
- Tax Credits

A Living Wage Should Be the Starting Point for ECE Compensation Strategies

Appropriate compensation for early educators means that:

- At a minimum, all those working with young children should earn at least the locally assessed living wage;
- Wages should additionally account for job role, experience, and education, with educators compensated fairly for the work they are already doing;
- Wage levels should calibrate upward from a living wage as the starting point to full parity with similarly qualified elementary school teachers; and
- Wage standards should apply whether educators are working in center or home-based programs.

ECE Workforce Compensation Should be Comparable to That of Other Educators

Early childhood education, rooted as it is in science and research, **is not a minimum-wage job**, and a self-sufficiency standard must be considered the floor and not the ceiling.

- 1. Compensation will be comparable** for early childhood educators with comparable qualifications, experience, and job responsibilities, **regardless of the setting of their job.**
2. Compensation will include the provision of an **adequate benefits package.**
3. Compensation will **increase commensurate with increased preparation** and increased competency.
4. Compensation will **not be differentiated based on the ages of children served.**

Compensation Strategies Should Establish, Elevate, and Advance ECE Professionals



Provide early childhood educators with equitable compensation that reflects their importance in educating children and supporting the larger economy.



Support the establishment of an Early Care and Education Profession in Minnesota through the adoption of the Power to the Profession Framework for defining and advancing the field and align compensation to the framework through the use of wage scales and other mechanisms.



Support early childhood professionals in earning early childhood credits and degrees and invest in the institutes of higher education that confer credentials

Themes From Our Jamboard Session

Qualified

Qualified ECE staff are . .

- Competent
- Skilled
- Educated
- Experienced
- Culturally Competent

They have access to ongoing professional development

They have received education and training in ECE **and/or** they have obtained requisite experience

Diverse

ECE staff represent . . .

- A mix of ages
- A mix of genders
- A variety of experiences
- The children they are serving

Supported

Supported ECE staff receive. . .

- Equitable pay
- Comprehensive benefits
- Prep time
- Ongoing professional development
- Decision making input

They are valued as professionals by parents & families, their organizations, and society

Equitably Compensated

Equitable compensation for ECE staff . . .

- Includes benefits
- Is comparable to other educators and similarly situated professionals
- Provide family-sustaining wages
- Reflects the education and experience required to do the job
- Is *equal* pay regardless of setting or child age group

Financial Compensation Discussion

Two Forms of Compensation

Equitably Compensated

Include a compensation framework that supports recruitment and retention of a qualified workforce in every early care and education setting

Set compensation for early childhood educators by reference to compensation for elementary school teachers



Financial Compensation



Non-Wage Compensation (Benefits)

Proposed MN ECE Professional Wage Scale

ECE Level	Educational Requirements	Role	Hourly Wage	Annual Wage	Wages Based On:
Base	High School Diploma	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paraprofessional 	\$15.00	\$31,200	Cost of Living (DEED)
ECE I	CDA Certificate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Support Educator in 0 – 5 settings Support Educator in Gr K – 3 settings 	\$18.20	\$37,856	One Minnesota Council on Inclusion and Equity Wage
ECE II	Early Childhood-related Associate Degree	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lead Educator in 0 – 5 settings Support Educator in Gr K – 3 settings Guide Practice of ECE I Roles 	\$22.75	\$47,320	125% of ECE I
ECE III	Early Childhood Ed BA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lead Educator in 0 – 5 settings Lead Educator in Gr K – 3 settings Guide Practice of ECE I and II Roles 	\$28.44	\$59,072	Parity with Public Preschool and Kindergarten Teachers (125% of ECE II)

Proposed Wage Scale

Reflections from Last Meeting

Key Takeaways:

- This proposal is meant as a floor, not a ceiling. It is meant to bring lower wage earners up to a higher wage, not take higher earners down to a lower level.
- This proposal is meant to close the gap between current wages and a livable wage. It compensates workers more for furthering their education.

Discussion Recap:

- The education requirements and roles from the Power to the Profession levels (ECE I, ECE II, and ECE III) may not always line up in all settings.
- It is hard for FCCs to see themselves in this proposal—they have more variation in their wages based on the sizes of their programs.
- There is a movement in various industries to develop standards across a wage scale – for example, the construction industry has a prevailing wage, rather than a standard minimum wage.

Salary Comparison with K-12 School Teachers

K-12 School Teachers Average Salary	District Name
\$81,168	Bloomington Public School District
\$81,779	Anoka-Hennepin Public School District
\$68,057	Duluth Public School District
\$64,003	Jackson County Central School District
\$61,908	Roseau Public School District

Family Child Care Considerations

- FCCs average annual revenue is \$50,938; annual expenses are \$26,372; this results in an average profit (salary) of just \$24,566.
- As both care providers *and* business owners, FCCs have unique challenges
- If FCCs accept CCAP, they don't recoup the full cost of providing care for that child *and* typically can't make up the difference through the private pay of other parents
 - In the 2020 Provider Survey, 40% of respondents (78) reported that they used CCAP when their business was in operation. Of these respondents, half (49%) said that higher CCAP rates “would have helped keep [their] child care business stay open for longer”.
- Asking FCCs to pay themselves or their staff a certain wage *without the help of additional subsidies*, is simply an unfunded mandate and creates undue burden

Where Does This Leave Us: Towards Financial Compensation Recommendations

Generally

- Minnesota's living wage (~\$15/hr) should be considered the floor for financial compensation of ECE workers across all settings and age groups
- Additional increases to financial compensation should be tied to one's experience and educational attainment

FCC Specific

1. Better research on the true operating expenses of FCCs (e.g. rent, food, transport, etc.) needs to be collected
2. For FCC owners, a wage floor should be reflective of their dual responsibilities as directors *and* providers of care and education
 - For additional staff, it should reflect the living wage

Non-Wage Compensation

Two Forms of Compensation

Equitably Compensated

Include a compensation framework that supports recruitment and retention of a qualified workforce in every early care and education setting

Set compensation for early childhood educators by reference to compensation for elementary school teachers



Financial Compensation



Non-Wage Compensation (Benefits)

ECE Workers' Access to Health Insurance and Pension Benefits is Limited

Employer-provided benefits, child care workers versus other workers, 2014

	All child care	All others	Difference	Child care benefit penalty ^a
<i>Health insurance coverage</i>	15.0%	49.9%	-34.9 ppt.	27.0 ppt.***
<i>Pension coverage</i>	9.6%	39.0%	-29.4 ppt.	24.1 ppt.***

The ECE workforce pays a penalty to work in their preferred profession

Lack of benefits is a factor in FCC closures

The three business factors respondents most listed as having a high impact on their closing were:

- 1. Lack of benefits, such as health insurance (40%)**
2. Long hours and schedule (34%)
3. Difficulty finding substitute providers (30%)

The supports that would have most helped keep providers in business longer were:

- a greater availability of substitutes
- grants to fund professional development, curriculum, equipment, or home improvement expenses
- business support (tax information, setting rates, etc.)

Common Minnesota K-12 Benefits

- Medical Insurance
- Dental Insurance
- Vision Insurance
- Voluntary Life Insurance & AD&D
- Flexible & Health Saving Accounts
- Savings Plans – 403(b) and 457
- Paid Vacation Days
- Accrued Sick Leave

Other ECE-specific benefits we have said make a difference:

- Paid prep time
- Availability of substitute teachers
- Access to ongoing professional development

Nationally Recommended Policy Changes to Non-Wage Compensation

1. Subsidize the costs of health insurance

- Subsidize, reimburse, or pay upfront costs of health insurance to educators.

2. Establish and expand substitute pools

- Use CCDBG relief dollars and/or targeted stabilization grants to expand substitute pool strategies so ECE staff can pursue professional development or utilize paid leave.

3. Ensure child care providers have access to child care subsidies for their own children

- Raise eligibility rates or create a separate category for eligibility for the ECE workforce.

4. Put income disregards in place

- Ensure ECE workforce in centers and family child care homes who are receiving increased and emergency financial support can be allowed up to \$10,000 of earnings to be disregarded

Tying it all together: Towards Total Compensation Recommendations

- Minnesota's living wage (~\$15/hr) should be considered the floor for financial compensation of ECE workers across all settings and age groups
- Additional increases to financial compensation should be tied to one's experience and educational attainment
- Non-wage compensation (benefits) should be prioritized to protect the physical health, mental well-being, and professional development of ECE workers
- Full compensation packages (wages + benefits) should encourage the recruitment and retention of the ECE workforce and reflect the value of their role as professionals.

Next Steps

Planned Sequencing of Discussions

Meeting Date	Topic
February	What do we mean by qualified, diverse, supported and equitably compensated?
March - May	Equitable Compensation & Qualified Workforce <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Salary scale & wages• Benefits & Non-monetary compensation• Qualifications & credentialing
June - July	Diversity and Racial Equity
August	Supporting the ECE workforce
September – October (TBD)	Finalize Recommendations

Anticipated Timeline



Monthly meetings February through September 2022

- May 11th | 6:00-8:00 PM
- June 8th | 6:00-8:00 PM
- July 13th | 6:00-8:00 PM
- August 10th | 6:00-8:00 PM
- September 14th | 6:00-8:00 PM
- *October TBD*

Next Steps

- Our next meeting will take place on Wednesday, May 11th from 6:00 - 8:00 pm
- Who can volunteer to present an update for our group at the next taskforce meeting on 4/26?

