Welcome!

- Welcome to the Task Force on Eliminating Subminimum Wages meeting!
- Please use this time to get settled and test the online meeting technology
- Meeting controls to be familiar with during task force meeting (located at the bottom of the screen):
  - **Mute/unmute**: Mute and unmute your microphone.
  - **Stop video/Start video**: Turns your camera on or off.
  - **Participants**: See who’s currently in the meeting.
  - **Reactions (smiley face icon)**: Provides ability to “raise hand” that appears on-camera.
Online process and norms

• Please say your name when you speak.
• Put yourself on mute when not speaking.
• To participate - use “raise hand” feature in Zoom or raise your hand; then unmute.
• Participate in a manner that is most meaningful to you. Use video, if possible.
• Show up as it best suits you.
• Honor your needs throughout the meeting.
• Technical difficulties happen. Contact (Jake Granholm from MAD; Jacob.Granholm@state.mn.us) for help.
• Ryan Merz (DHS-DSD) provided a subminimum wage overview on Friday, March 4

• Presentation topics included:
  • Background on subminimum wages and federal policy
  • Concerns with subminimum wages, alternatives, and concerns with eliminating
  • National trends on subminimum wages and Minnesota data
Why do we have subminimum wages?

• This practice began in 1938 and continues at the federal level today
  • Businesses who hold a permit (called a “14c certificate”) are legally allowed to pay people with disabilities below the federal minimum wage

• Often used as part of employment services designed to train participants and help them advance towards competitive employment
  • Most businesses holding a 14c certificate are organizations that provide disability services
Minnesota – How many people earn subminimum wages?

- 75 employers in Minnesota hold or have pending 14c certificates – all are disability employment service providers
- DHS and MAD estimate that between 4,500 and 6,000 people were paid subminimum wages in Program Year (PY) 2021 based on data from required conversations and how many people providers report serving in 14c applications.
• In 2018, Minnesota Department of Human Services spent $239 million funding facility-based work – often at subminimum wages compared with $20.9 million (or 5.1% total waiver funding) on integrated employment services.

• Minnesota, as a percentage of total population, has the highest rate of people being paid subminimum wages of any state in the US and ranks 3rd overall among states in total number of people being paid subminimum wages.
Why a move away from subminimum wages?

• **Effectiveness of subminimum wages**: There is not evidence that subminimum wages help people to achieve competitive employment

• **Civil rights concerns**: A 2020 report by the US Commission on Civil Rights recommended the phase out of subminimum wages

• Organizations – Such as the National Association of State Directors of Developmental Disability Services (NASDDDS) have called for an end to 14c
Why do we still use subminimum wages?

• **Widely used component of disability services:** Especially in Minnesota, subminimum wages are used in services that people receive and value.

• **Concerns with ending 14c (from human rights commission public comments)**
  - Value in knowing a loved one has a place to go each day
  - Value one receives from being employed and get a paycheck, no matter how small
  - People like existing jobs and should be able to choose where they will work
  - Fear that people will not be able to effectively compete on open marketplace and will end up unemployed.
  - Note: 98% of public comments for the report expressed wanting to keep 14c program
Employment Services in Minnesota

• Existing employment services in Minnesota include:
  • Waiver employment services
  • County funded services
  • Vocational Rehabilitation Services
  • Extended Employment

• What are the alternatives to subminimum wages?
  • Minnesota has supports to help people engage, plan, find, and maintain competitive employment
  • Customized Employment and Supported Employment
  • Day support services: Supports to participate in personally meaningful activities
A shift away from subminimum wages for some states

Subminimum wage eliminated = 5
• Alaska (February 2018)
• Hawaii (January 2022)
• Maine (December 2019)
• Maryland (October 2020)
• New Hampshire (July 2015)

No 14(c) certificate holders = 3
• District of Columbia
• Rhode Island
• Vermont (none since 2016)

Phasing out subminimum wages = 7
• California (January 2024)
• Colorado (July 2025)
• Delaware (July 2023)
• North Carolina, pending funds to implement (2027)
• Oregon (June 2023)
• Texas, with exceptions (September 2022)
• Washington (August 2023)

Other
• IL eliminated subminimum wages in state contracting
• Legislatures in 7 states have introduced but have not passed legislation to end use of subminimum wages
Vote to extend task force meetings

• The rationale for extending the meetings is because the Task Force has a big charge in a short amount of time.

• Feedback from member poll
  • 11 members responded to the survey question about extending the meeting time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response option</th>
<th>Member response counts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Extend meeting by 1 hour</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extend meetings by 30 minutes</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not extend the length of meetings</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Discussion and questions
• Today we would like to vote to extend task force meetings by up to 1 hour.
• A roll call vote will be used.
• Members will vote yes or no to extend the task force meetings by up to 1 hour.
• The task force strives for consensus with decision making whenever possible, but a supermajority (75% of task force membership) will count if task force members cannot reach consensus.
  • If 75% of the members present are in favor of an action (12 of the 16 task force members if all members are present), then the task force will advance that action.
Task Force on Eliminating Subminimum Wages

(note: phases are estimates and may be updated, as needed)
• Attend scheduled meetings
• Complete assignments on time
• Contribute to overall goal of taskforce and collaborate in seeking solutions.
• Examine, analyze, and synthesize information especially input from community engagement effort.
• Give input to final legislative report with recommendations for action.
• Serve as liaison to their organization; inform agency and organization leadership of task force progress (as applicable)
• Anything else?

Questions and discussion
An Overview of the Proposed Engagement, Outreach, and Communications Process and Key Tools

Public Sector Consultants
Public Sector Consultants is a certified Women-owned Small Business and a Women’s Business Enterprise, and we are committed to creating a space for all voices to be heard and understood. We have served hundreds of government agencies, nonprofits, associations, and regulated industries in our more than 40-year history. We take pride in our role as an independent, nonpartisan public policy consulting firm that is trusted, respected, and engaged in our community.

Our mission is to improve the quality of life for residents of Michigan and beyond through the development and implementation of innovative, actionable public policies.
Outreach, Marketing, and Communications Roadmap

1. Planning
2. Strategy Development
3. Implementation
4. Measurement
5. Refinement
# Proposed Planning Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>March</th>
<th>April</th>
<th>May</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3/8 Task Force Update</td>
<td>Planning Session 1</td>
<td>Planning Session 2</td>
<td>Task Force Update</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time Allotted</td>
<td>45 min</td>
<td>3 hours</td>
<td>2 hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audience</td>
<td>Full Task Force</td>
<td>Engagement and Communications Workgroup</td>
<td>Full Task Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity Description</td>
<td>• Present SWOT</td>
<td>• Session 1 reflection</td>
<td>• Session 2 reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Review mission and vision</td>
<td>• Subgroup objectives</td>
<td>• Subgroup timelines and measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Outline overall goals through consensus build</td>
<td>• Share outcomes</td>
<td>• Share outcomes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>April</th>
<th>May</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Task Force Update</td>
<td>Planning Session 3</td>
<td>Task Force Update</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time Allotted</td>
<td>5 min</td>
<td>2 hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audience</td>
<td>Full Task Force</td>
<td>Full Task Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity Description</td>
<td>• Session 2 reflection</td>
<td>• Session 2 reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Subgroup timelines and measures</td>
<td>• Subgroup timelines and measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Share outcomes</td>
<td>• Share outcomes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Community engagement tools we may use include:

- Virtual Insight Panel (VIP)
- Interviews
- Focus groups
- Community forums
- Digital surveys
Marketing and communications tools we may use include:

- Virtual Insight Panel (VIP)
- Web page or microsite
- Social media
- Search engine advertising and e-mail marketing
- Webinar development
- Press releases
- Media outreach
- Video production
Core Principles Exercise

Public Sector Consultants
“What core principles guide the task force’s work with each other and with others impacted by subminimum wage?”
• **Next task force meeting**: Tuesday, April 12, 2022 (on Zoom)
  - Based on member poll results, task force meeting dates will be the second Tuesday of each month, with exceptions.
  - Meeting dates list sent in email by Jake Granholm

• **Opportunity for member feedback**: please complete the short member feedback survey.

• **Questions between meetings?**: Contact Jake Granholm (jacob.granholm@state.mn.us)

Thank you for your time today!