The survey was sent to a total of 1,623 active email addresses of former licensed family child care providers whose records showed that they closed between 2017-19.

We received 242 responses, representing a 15% response rate.

16 respondents said they remained open, resulting in 226 complete responses.

### Tables:Respondent Demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Survey Respondents</th>
<th>All Providers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7 County Metro</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central / West Central</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northwest</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southwest</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast / Southern</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years Open</th>
<th>Survey Respondents</th>
<th>All Providers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Under 5</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 to 9</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 to 14</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 15</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary Findings

• Almost half of providers started their business primarily to either raise or provide child care for their own children.

• The factors that most providers said had high impacts on closing were complying with regulations, completing paperwork and documentation, and a lack of benefits (e.g. health insurance).

• The most utilized supports were the Child and Adult Care Food Program, Child Care Assistance Program and Parent Aware Grants.

• The supports that would have most helped keep providers in business longer were a greater availability of substitutes, grants to fund professional development, curriculum, equipment, or home improvement expenses, and business support (tax information, setting rates, etc.).
• 48% of providers stated that their **primary reason** for becoming a licensed family child care provider was either to **raise or provide child care for their own children**.

• Over half (51%) of respondents closed their license before they wanted to.

---

Q: What was your primary reason for becoming a licensed family child care provider?

- To provide child care for my own children: 27%
- To raise my own children: 21%
- To work in child care or early childhood: 21%
- To work from home: 15%
- Other: 9%
- To earn a regular income: 8%

Q: Did you close your family child care license before you wanted to?

- No: 49%
- Yes: 51%
The three business factors respondents most listed as having a high impact on their closing were:

1. Lack of benefits, such as health insurance (40%)
2. Long hours and schedule (34%)
3. Difficulty finding substitute providers (30%)

Q: How much impact did these business factors have on your decision to close your child care business?

- Lack of benefits (health insurance,...): 40% High Impact, 14% Medium Impact, 21% Low Impact, 25% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Long hours, schedule: 34% High Impact, 31% Medium Impact, 18% Low Impact, 17% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Difficulty finding substitute providers: 31% High Impact, 16% Medium Impact, 21% Low Impact, 32% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Home maintenance requirements (wear...): 28% High Impact, 28% Medium Impact, 27% Low Impact, 17% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Not enough income / low earnings: 26% High Impact, 22% Medium Impact, 27% Low Impact, 25% No Impact or Not Applicable
- CCAP (child care subsidy) reimbursement...: 19% High Impact, 9% Medium Impact, 17% Low Impact, 54% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Food program reimbursement rate was too...: 17% High Impact, 19% Medium Impact, 20% Low Impact, 43% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Families couldn’t pay the rate I would need: 15% High Impact, 18% Medium Impact, 27% Low Impact, 40% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Physically-demanding work: 15% High Impact, 24% Medium Impact, 33% Low Impact, 27% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Limited or no professional support: 12% High Impact, 19% Medium Impact, 33% Low Impact, 36% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Managing relationships with parents: 9% High Impact, 13% Medium Impact, 32% Low Impact, 46% No Impact or Not Applicable
- Managing enrollment, turnover in families: 8% High Impact, 12% Medium Impact, 39% Low Impact, 40% No Impact or Not Applicable
The three **administrative factors** respondents most listed as having a **high impact on their closing** were:

1. Complying with other regulations (45%*)
2. Completing required paperwork and documentation (37%)
3. Training requirements (32%)

It is worth noting that 78% said their interactions with the county licensor had no or low impact on their decision to close.

*feedback included: various correction orders for what providers viewed as minor infringements (e.g. weeds in the yard), and general stress of an unannounced licensing visit and ambiguity in interpretation of rules.

Q: How much impact did these administrative factors have on your decision to close your child care business?

![Impact Distribution Chart](chart.png)
The three **personal factors** respondents most listed as having a **high impact on their closing** were:

1. Other personal reasons (37%)
2. Wanted a change in job field or job conditions (27%)
3. Isolation from other adults (24%)

Q: How much impact did these personal factors have on your decision to close your child care business?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>High Impact</th>
<th>Medium Impact</th>
<th>Low Impact</th>
<th>No Impact or low impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Other personal reasons</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wanted a change in job field or job conditions</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isolation from other adults</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentally demanding work</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retirement from work</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No longer needed to care for my own family</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Legend:**
- High Impact
- Medium Impact
- Low Impact
- No Impact or low impact
Paperwork and documentation were a burden for many providers. The majority of participants responded that the following types of documentation were either burdensome or very burdensome:

1. Relicensing forms (64%)
2. Record keeping, such as taxes and employee records (61%)
3. Ongoing updates to children’s records (53%)

Q: Documentation is required as part of running a licensed child care business. To what extent were the following types of documentation burdensome for you?
When asked about the difficulty of complying with regulations relating to minimum health and safety standards, the majority of respondents answered that the following regulations were either not difficult at all or not applicable, or not very difficult:

1. Water, food and nutrition requirements (91% of respondents)
2. Physical location or space requirements (86% of respondents)
3. Background study requirements (84%)

Q: Regulations are intended to ensure minimum health and safety standards. To what extent was complying with these regulations difficult for you?

- Water, food, and nutrition requirements: 3% very difficult, 6% difficult, 51% not very difficult, 40% not difficult at all or not applicable
- Physical location or space requirements: 5% very difficult, 9% difficult, 53% not very difficult, 33% not difficult at all or not applicable
- Behavior guidance requirements: 2% very difficult, 13% difficult, 48% not very difficult, 36% not difficult at all or not applicable
- Background study requirements: 6% very difficult, 10% difficult, 44% not very difficult, 40% not difficult at all or not applicable
- Activities and equipment requirements: 17% very difficult, 44% difficult, 35% not very difficult, 35% not difficult at all or not applicable
- Infant safe sleep requirements: 14% very difficult, 19% difficult, 38% not very difficult, 30% not difficult at all or not applicable
- Capacity, ratio and age distribution requirements: 11% very difficult, 23% difficult, 38% not very difficult, 28% not difficult at all or not applicable
- Infant safe sleep requirements: 14% very difficult, 19% difficult, 38% not very difficult, 30% not difficult at all or not applicable
Training

- Providers generally could afford training
- 70% stated that their ability to afford training was not difficult or not very difficult
- However, 65% responded it was either difficult or very difficult in that it took time away from business or family to attend training.

Q: Training is required for all licensed providers. To what extent were the following factors related to training difficult for you?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Very difficult</th>
<th>Difficult</th>
<th>Not very difficult</th>
<th>Not difficult at all or not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Taking time away from business or family to attend training</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to find training that’s convenient for me (time offered, frequency, location)</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to find training of interest to me</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding training requirements</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to afford training</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The most utilized supports were:

- Child and Adult Care Food Program (73%)
- Child Care Assistance Program (35%)
- Parent Aware Grants (15%)

Almost a sixth (15%) were not aware of the supports listed (it is possible that respondents interpreted this as “I was not aware of some of these supports”)

Q: Did you make use of any of the following supports, payments, or assistance during the time your business was in operation?
The **supports** most providers said would have **helped keep them in business for longer** were:

1. Greater availability of substitutes (48%)
2. Grants to fund professional development, curriculum, equipment, or home improvement expenses (43%)
3. Business support (tax information, setting rates, etc.) (43%)

**Q: Which of these additional supports or services, if any, would have helped you keep your child care business open for longer?**
Difficulty finding substitutes was one of the factors providers listed as having a significant impact on closing. However, effects were not felt equally by all providers. Breaking respondents by region, we see those in the Northeast and Central regions were the most affected, whereas age of business was not highly correlated.

Q: How much impact did these business factors [Difficulty finding substitute providers] have on your decision to close your child care business?

By region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>High Impact</th>
<th>Medium Impact</th>
<th>Low Impact</th>
<th>No Impact or Not Applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minneapolis or Saint Paul</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburban Metro</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southwest</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northwest</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By years in business

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years in business</th>
<th>High Impact</th>
<th>Medium Impact</th>
<th>Low Impact</th>
<th>No Impact or Not Applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10+</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 - 9</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 6</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 - 4</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 - 1</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The most widely used support service reported by respondents was the Child & Adult Care Food Program, with 86% answering (166) that they had used it during the time they were in business. Of these respondents who used Child & Adult Care Food Program:

• 39% answered that the food program reimbursement rate being too low had either a “high” or “medium” impact on their decision to close their child care business

• Half (50%) answered that food program forms were not very burdensome, not burdensome at all or not applicable

Q: How much impact did these business factors have on your decision to close your child care business? [Food program reimbursement rate was too low] [only for those who answered that they used the Child & Adult Care Food Program]

Q: Documentation is required as part of running a licensed child care business. To what extent were the following types of documentation burdensome for you? [Food program forms] [only for those who answered that they used the Child & Adult Care Food Program]
Providers in business for longer, were more likely to make use of the CACFP.

- 59% of providers who closed within 0 – 1 years of opening had utilized the CACFP
- 85% of providers who were in business for 11 years or longer had utilized the CACFP
40% of respondents (78) reported that they used CCAP when their business was in operation. Of these respondents who used CCAP:

- Half (49%) answered that higher CCAP rates “would have helped keep [their] child care business open for longer”.
- Half (49%) answered that the CCAP reimbursement rate being too low had either a “high” or “medium” impact on their decision to close their child care business.
- Over half (59%) answered that CCAP forms were not very burdensome, not burdensome at all or not applicable.
Closure Prior to Intent

Although most factors had similar impacts on providers regardless of whether they closed early or not, providers who did not close earlier than they wanted to were more likely to report the following factors as having a high impact on their decision to close:

- **Business factors**: long hours

- **Personal factors**: isolation from other adults, wanted a change in job field or job conditions

Q: How much impact did these business factors have on your decision to close your child care business?

**Long hours, schedule:**

- Closed early: 24% High, 34% Medium, 21% Low, 21% No Impact
- Did not close early: 45% High, 27% Medium, 15% Low, 14% No Impact

**Isolation from other adults:**

- Closed early: 16% High, 28% Medium, 28% Low, 28% No Impact
- Did not close early: 32% High, 23% Medium, 24% Low, 22% No Impact

**Wanted a change in job field or job conditions:**

- Closed early: 19% High, 14% Medium, 32% Low, 35% No Impact
- Did not close early: 35% High, 22% Medium, 15% Low, 27% No Impact
Suggestions & Recommendations – Examples I

- **Moving towards electronic documentation and record keeping**
  - “Electronic Documentation would be great. Could a site be set up where the provider enters information monthly? Or an app? Let's use technology! I think electronic resources/record keeping between licensing and the provider would help tremendously.”
  - “I didn't like that they make you do the same paperwork over and over every year when it was the same. Waste of time and paper. Put it online and then if anything changes just a click of a button.”

- **More established providers not having to repeat trainings multiple times**
  - “Trainings were getting stale. Even through eager to learn. Tired of taking same old same old”
  - “Why did we have to take some training over and OVER? I think some should be changed to every few years after you have been in business for so long, like SBS/AHT and SIDS. It is honestly more of a waste of time for providers and could be better used for other training of interest.”

- **Desired additional business supports (setting up an LLC, business loans, advertising and marketing)**
  - “Business loans to create a nature based learning environment. Funds to be used for real estate, equipment, transportation, marketing and scholarships for families”
  - “Advertising and maybe access/subsidies to do a program outside my own home”
• Reducing paperwork requirements
  o “Mostly decided to end my Child care was because of all the things meaning rules and regulations, paperwork and requirements that forced me to close down…”
  o “The paperwork overload was what finally did me in. Between county requirements and the food program, it was too much. Food Program drop-ins, paperwork and their web-site was always having problems, was the worst.”

• Increased support, both from their regulator and mentors / other providers
  o “I would like to see a more supportive role between licensor and provider. I ran a small daycare that usually had a waiting list. I always had good inspections from my licensor. It still seemed like the licensor was looking for something to catch me on rather than using that time to support, train, encourage, or make recommendations”
  o “There weren't mentors/coaches, no startup grants…”
  o “The main reason I am no longer a licensed child care provider is because of the stringent rules. I got no support from the licenser in the way of being positive”

• Several providers felt uncomfortable with their family members (spouse, teenage children) having to be fingerprinted for a background check
  o “…Fingerprinting and increasing background study requirements on my FAMILY (not on me) were the biggest issue…”
  o “My husband was uncomfortable with fingerprinting as a requirement and felt it was an overreach”
Thank you!

Laura Kramer
laura.Kramer@state.mn.us