How to Hire and Keep Great DSPs using the Workforce Toolkit
July 31, 2019
Minnesota Age and Disabilities Odyssey Conference
Today’s Presenters

Claire Benway- cebenway@umn.edu
Nancy McCulloh - mccul037@umn.edu
Macdonald Metzger - metz0171@umn.edu
Chet Tschetter - tsch0042@umn.edu

Research and Training Center on Community Living
Institute on Community Integration (UCEDD)
University of Minnesota, Twin Cities
Learning Objectives

• Identify and explain the effective use of retention tools available in the DSP workforce tool kit.

• Develop an action plan for implementing retention strategies in their organization.

• Identify other retention tools they can use to keep great DSPs.
Finding Great DSPs
Building & Strengthening the DSP Workforce

- Recruitment & Selection
  - Targeted Marketing
  - Realistic Job Previews
  - Structured Interviewing
  - Status and Awareness (PSAs)

- Retention
  - DSW Competencies
  - Education and Training
  - Credentialing and Career Paths
  - Recognition
  - Membership and Networking
Context is Everything

Person. Family. Community.
United States of America
Advocacy and increased expectations
Outcomes

Quality of services and support that promote community living
A matter of dignity

- Dead end jobs
- Low pay
- Alone and at risk
- Families wait years
- Inclusion pays off
- Intimacy denied

New reports on Direct Support Professionals highlight low pay, poor benefits
DSP Recruitment and Retention: A Self-Advocate Perspective

• We want staff who show up on time and help us get the stuff done we need to get done
• We want people who are paid enough to stay so they like what they are doing
• We want people who respect us and are respected for what they do and the pay they earn

Cliff Poetz, Self Advocate Leader
Who Are We Talking About?

Direct Support Professionals
• Personal care attendant
• Direct care worker
• Direct support staff
• Community living specialist
• Job coach
• Employment specialist
• Etc.....
Communities fight for higher wages for fast food workers but not for DSPs.
**Workforce conditions that deter entry into the profession**

- Low wages
- Meager benefits
- Physically challenging work (high rate of injury)
- High accountability for actions
- Isolation from other workers and supervisors
- Lack of a career ladder
- Insufficient training and professional development
National Scope

Turnover Rate

44.8% Turnover rate in DSP workforce

Tenure

17.5% Fewer than 6 months
14.6% 6-12 months
56.9% 12 months or longer

*The percentages do not add to 100 because all organizations did not report for each category.

Health Insurance & Benefits

Health insurance offered to 10% of all DSPs

Starting & Average Wages

Starting hourly wages for DSPs
$8.66
$10.23 average starting
$13.67

Average hourly wages for DSPs
$9.10
$11.11 average
$13.97

Source: National Core Indicators, 2017
National Picture of Homecare Workforce

BY EMPLOYMENT STATUS, 2017
- Full time: 60%
- Part time: 40%

BY POVERTY LEVEL, 2016
- <100% Federal Poverty Level: 19%
- <138% Federal Poverty Level: 31%
- <200% Federal Poverty Level: 49%

ACCESSING PUBLIC ASSISTANCE, 2016
- Any Public Assistance: 51%
- Food and Nutrition Assistance: 30%
- Medicaid: 30%
- Cash Assistance: 3%

Source: PHI 2018
MN picture of workforce poverty level

Source: PHI 2018
MN Picture of the DSW Wages

Statewide Cost of Living
• $15.39 needed for family of 3 (2 FT adults, 1 child)
• $38.25 needed for family of 3 (1 adult, 2 children)

(OES Data Tool, MN DEED)
National Picture of Homecare Workforce Growth

Projected Growth in Home Care Workers
2016 - 2026

- Total Home Care Workers: 1,382,200
- Home Health Aide: 431,200
- Nurse Aide: 173,400
- Personal Care Aide: 777,600

MN Picture of Homecare Workforce Growth

DIRECT CARE WORKER PROJECTED JOB OPENINGS, 2016 TO 2026
MINNESOTA

Source: PHI 2018
Most MN DSW Positions are Part-time

54% were part-time  46% were full-time

Among part time workers:
• Lower wages
• Less access to health insurance
• Less access to paid time off

Worker survey results:
– 68% of DSW would want more hours or take full time work if available
– 28% of DSW have one or more additional jobs
MN Turnover & Vacancy Rates

39% annual turnover rate

61% annual retention rate

Of those DSWs who left their position, 46% left within 6 months of hire

15% of positions were vacant
Impact of staff turnover on UMN intervention implementation studies

- **Active Support** (Larson, Ticha & Qian, 2014)
- **Self-Determination** (Abery & Ticha, 2014)
- **Comprehensive Training** (Hewitt, Nord & Bogenshutz, 2014)
- **Participatory Planning and Decision Making Group (PPDM)** (Abery, Ticha & Qian, 2015)
High expectation discrepancy

- Specialized knowledge
- Comply with rules and regulations
- Teach
- Document
- Support choice
- Culturally competent
- Respect rights
- Problem-solve
- Medical support
- Person-centered
- Work well with others
- End shift neat & tidy
- Maintain health & safety
Solutions to consider

Recruitment and Selection Strategies
Business Acumen

• Targeted Marketing
• Structured Behavioral Interview Questions and Interviewers Guide
• National Frontline Supervisor Competencies (NFSC)
• Customized and Branded Public Service Announcements (PSAs)
• Customized Realistic Job Previews (RJPs)
• Recruitment bonuses
The Challenges & Costs of Recruiting

- Traditional candidate pool is shrinking
- Economy improving – more competition
- Multi-generational workforce
- Estimated cost of hiring and training new DSPs is estimated at $4,200-5,400 per position
- DSP vacancy rates result in increased stress on the remaining workforce

(ANCOR, 2017; Hewitt and Larson, 2007)
What do you know?

• What data do you routinely gather?
• How do you use it?
• What don’t you have that you wish you had?
• How do you use data to pitch your case?
Turnover

What are the DSP turnover rates in your organization?

- Under 20%
- 21-30%
- 31-40%
- 41-50%
- 51-60%
- over 61%
Quick look – Do you know?

- DSP Turnover, vacancy, and retention rates?
- FLS Turnover, vacancy, and retention rates?
- What recruitment and workforce intervention strategies being utilized?
- How much are you spending on average each month in overtime expenses?
- What the average number of hours of training your DSPs receive during orientation and annually thereafter?
Replacement costs related to turnover

- 1,276,000 DSPs
- Estimated costs to replace each DSP $4,073
- 574,200 are replaced each year
- Costs = 2,338,716,600
  - Roughly $2,000 per DSP ($1 per hour)
Target Marketing

How can you use targeting marketing to improve recruitment?
Inside sources:
Examples of recruitment sources

- Current employees
  - Referral bonuses
- People receiving services and their families or friends
- Volunteers
- Social media networks that are existing “friends” of the organization
- Service coordinators or case managers
- Board members
- Others
Outside sources:
Examples of recruitment sources

- Newspaper advertisements
- Internet ads
  - Craig’s list
  - Linked in
- Fliers regarding open positions
- Job boards and placement offices in high schools and colleges
- Others
Stayers: who are they and where are they?

• What does the data you gather tell you about who stays longest in your organization?
• Who are your best employees?
• Where can you gain access to more people with similar characteristics?
• How are you marketing and recruiting to find their clones?
Expanded workforce pipeline

• High school students
• Immigrants and expanded cultural, ethnic and linguistic diversity
• Encore workers
Realistic Job Previews

Present non-distorted information to job applicants

- About the job
- About the organization / family / individual(s)
- Shown before a job offer has been made
Realistic Job Previews are used as part of the Selection process

**Who**
- Potential Recruits
- Job Candidates

**When**
- Job Fairs
- Recruiting Events
- Workforce One Stop Centers
- Interview Process
Benefits of Realistic Job Previews

Candidates understand job expectations before they start the job

Candidates make informed decision

Candidates can self-select out
RJPs and retention

- RJP’s improve retention rates by 9% - 17%
- RJP’s increase retention of workers
  - 12% for agencies with annual retention rates of 50%, and
  - 24% for agencies with annual retention rates of 20%
ANCOR Realistic Job Preview

NYSACRA Realistic Job Preview
What are Structured Behavioral Interviews?

- The best predictor of future behavior is past behavior in similar circumstances that was recent or that reflected longstanding behavior patterns.
- Ask candidates to describe situations they have faced and how they handled them.
- Situation, Behavior, Outcome
- Based on NADSP Competency Areas
Structured Behavioral Interviews

Sample Question:

Competency area 1: PARTICIPANT EMPOWERMENT

Describe a situation when you assisted an individual to recognize that he or she had several choices in how to handle a difficult problem. What was the situation, what did you do, and what was the final outcome?
Another Example

Sample Question:

Competency area 4: COMMUNITY & SERVICE NETWORKING

*Please describe some community resources you have had contact with in your own neighborhood. How might those resources be used by a person with a disability?*
Structured Behavioral Interview Tools

Structured Interview Questionnaire

Complete List of Behavioral Interview Questions

Presented for your use jointly by

Behavioral Interviewing

A Users Quick Guide

Structured Interview Questionnaire

Interview Template

Presented for your use jointly by
PSA – Public Service Announcements

- Component of recruitment campaign
- Raise community awareness of DSPs
- Celebrate profession
- Combine with annual DSP national week

ANCOR Public Service Announcements

NYSACRA Public Service Announcements
Minnesota Grown
Public Awareness and Advocacy Campaign

Minnesota - Best Life Alliance
Leaving in Action

Recruitment Action Planning – Handout Page 2

• Review your self assessment.
• What did you learn?
• What is missing?

**Table Talk:** Share ideas for some action steps you can take in the next few weeks.
How to Keep Great DSPs
Building & Strengthening the DSP Workforce – Part 2

**Recruitment & Selection**
- Targeted Marketing
- Realistic Job Previews
- Structured Interviewing
- Status and Awareness (PSAs)

**Retention**
- DSW Competencies
- Education and Training
- Credentialing and Career Paths
- Recognition
- Membership and Networking
Workforce Outcomes
(reminder - NQF HCBS Domains and Subdomains)

Human and Legal Rights
- Freedom from abuse and neglect
- Informed decision-making
- Optimizing preservation of legal & human rights
- Privacy
- Supporting exercise of human & legal rights

Person-Centered Planning & Coordination
- Assessment
- Coordination
- Person-centered planning

Service Delivery and Effectiveness
- Delivery
- Person's identified goals realized
- Person's needs met

System Performance & Accountability
- Data management and use
- Evidence-based practice
- Financing and service delivery structures

Workforce
- Adequately compensated with benefits
- Culturally competent
- Demonstrated competencies when appropriate
- Person-centered approach to services
- Safety of and respect for the worker
- Workforce engagement and participation
- Sufficient workforce numbers dispersion and availability
DSP training + education + careers

- Competency Based Training
- Credentialing and Career Paths
What is Competency Based Training?

• Training that is focused on developing worker:
  • Knowledge (what a person knows)
  • Skills (what a person is able to do)
  • Attitudes (the way in which a DSP thinks about people with IDD, job and how they approach decision-making)

• Based on real work actions
• Goal of achieving required/desired outcomes
DSP competency sets 1996 - 2014

- Community Support Skill Standards*
- IDD Residential Core*
- NADSP Competencies*
- APSE
- DOL LTSS Core

Competencies*
- FLS*
- NADD
- CMS Core Competencies*

CSSS 1996
Hewitt 1998
NADSP 2002
APSE 2011
DOL LTSS 2012
FLS 2014
NADD 2014
CMS 2014

Community Supported Skill Standards
IDD Residential Core
NADSP Competencies
APSE
DOL LTSS Core Competencies
FLS
NADD
CMS Core Competencies
Competency Based Training Framework

- ID Training Outcomes
- ID Needed Skills & Competencies
- ID Skill Gaps
- ID & Develop Training Strategies & Content to fill the Gaps
- Deliver Training, Teach & Demo Job Skills
- Evaluate Skills, Performance, & Competency
Understands the theory of XXX, and has the skills and dispositions to successfully apply all of these at the beginning level in XXX situation.

Focus on what’s needed to be successful - outcomes

Source: Charla Long, 2017
Outcomes Associated with Competency-Based Training

- Quality Consumer Outcomes
- Increased DSW Competence
- Higher Job Satisfaction
- Competency-Based DSW Training
- Quality Service Delivery
- Higher Retention Rates
We are not even close to training/competence balance

240+ hours minimally needed to meet basics

40+ hours provided

Balance is achieved when Training → competence
- College of Direct Support & College of Frontline Supervision and Management
- College of Employment Services
- College of Personal Assistance & Caregiving
- College of Recovery & Community Inclusion
- Person Centered Counseling Training
Competency based training matters

Source: Hewitt, Nord, Bogenshutz 2013
Intervention: training approach

• Online training: College of Direct Support
  ▪ 35 lessons over 12 months
  ▪ 6 modules address different topics
  ▪ Pre/post-test measures

• Mentoring
  ▪ Supervisor or advanced DSP
  ▪ Mentoring on each module topic

• Group discussion
  ▪ With peers and supervisors
  ▪ Provided for each module
Comprehensive training study

Findings

- Intervention sites experience 16.4% decrease in turnover after one year
- DSPs showed increased competence (Rights & Choice, Health & Safety, Relationships)
- DSPs showed increased satisfaction with supervisors

Source: Hewitt, Nord, Bogenshutz 2014
Overall trend of DSP skills:
  • Intervention group had significantly higher ratings after 1-year in areas related to –
    • rights & choice
    • support in home & work
    • supporting relationships
    • safety & health

On a 5-point scale:
  0 = No skill; 1 = Introductory; 2 = Practice; 3 = Proficient; 4 = Advanced
National Frontline Supervisor Competencies

April, 2013
National Frontline Supervisor Competencies

Frontline Supervisor Assessment

April, 2013

Research & Training Center on Community Living
Institute on Community Integration (UCEDD)

University of Minnesota
Driven to Discover™

Frontline Supervisor Structured Behavioral Interview Questions

April, 2013

Research & Training Center on Community Living
Institute on Community Integration (UCEDD)

University of Minnesota
Driven to Discover™
Focus on frontline supervisors

• DSP turnover is lower when
  • DSPs feel valued
  • DSPs feel they are treated fairly
• Reasons DSPs leave
  • issues with co-workers
  • issues with supervisors
FLS wages are not great and turnover is high

New York data

• **FLS wages**
  - Average starting salary was $34,956.06 ($16.80/hr)
  - Average FLS salary was $40,253.54 ($19.35/hr)
  - Average highest FLS salary was $52,183.12 ($25.08/hr)

• **FLS turnover**
  - Average **FLS turnover rate** was 13.0% (ranged from 0 to 50%)
  - Average **FLS vacancy rate** for the entire sample was 5.3% (range from 0 to 33.3%).

(Hewitt et. al., 2015)
Where are FLS new hires recruited?

- **42% promotion of existing employees**
- 17% websites such as Craig’s List
- 10% referrals given by current employees
- 9% newspaper or circular ads
- 1% private employment or temporary staffing agencies
- 1% school or training placement programs
- 1% social media such as LinkedIn and Facebook
- 5% came from other sources
- (14% did not track this information)

(Hewitt et. al., 2015)
Strategies to increase effectiveness of remote supervision

- Communicate frequently and listen
- Use technology
- Staff –centered communication approach
  - Phone
  - Text
  - E-mail
- Communicate accountabilities and follow up often
- Use animated gifs and emoticons to convey emotion
- Provide right tools
Strategies continued

• Insist on some face-to-face that is
  • Network focused
  • Relationship building
  • Not all business (staff meetings don’t count)
• Make time weekly for one-to-one
• Make time for small talk
• Use video
  • Skype
  • Google Hangouts
  • Sqwiggle
Group Discussion Question

Identify areas where you feel your organizations should better prepare FLS (and consider how)

National Frontline Supervisor Competencies
Supporting frontline supervisors

• Use evidence based Frontline Supervisor Competencies that reflect best practice in current service system.

• Use on-line workforce development tools utilizing these competencies, including:
  • candidate assessment tool
  • peer assessment
  • selection tool
  • training and development tool
  • performance evaluation
Organizational culture

• Intentional learning
• Leader who knows the direct line staff by name
  • Goes out of their way to engage
  • Periodically practices direct support
  • Celebrates DSPs
• Individual story-driven
• Data-driven
  • Makes data driven decisions regarding workforce
  • Monitoring is routine
• Engages DSPs at all levels
Creating a competitive edge

• Organizational culture is your competitive edge
• It takes a lot of effort and work to create an organizational culture that supports DSP
• “DSP week” is 52 weeks a year!
Service model redesign

- Shared living
- Independent contractors
- DSP worker cooperatives
- Self-directed service expansion
  - Direct Support Workforce Registries and Matching Services
Community and family as focus of interventions and services

- Putting faith to work
- Social inclusion: A community intervention
- Retirement
- Targeted focused work with diverse communities
  - Community liaisons
- Direct support professionals providing direct intervention and support with communities (e.g. businesses, faith communities, recreational programs, adult education)
Supporting Independence - Technology first approaches

- Sensors
- Remote Monitoring
- Computer-Assisted Devices (Tablets, Smartphones)
- Transportation Technologies
- Electronic Medication Dispensers
- Smart Homes
- Personal Robots and Assistants
Report to the President - America’s DSP Crisis

- DSP wages and compensation packages
- TA and incentives to states for technology
- TA on Business acumen
- Public education on the DSP profession
- Expand self-directed LTSS
- Recognize DSP as a profession – DOL BLS
- Invest in career training and credentialing DSPs
- Create opportunities for matching registry services and other creative matching options for DSPs and individuals
We must do something radically different

If we want change.....
Questions & For More Information

Claire Benway- cebenway@umn.edu
Nancy McCulloh - mccul037@umn.edu
Macdonald Metzger - metz0171@umn.edu
Chet Tschetter - tsch0042@umn.edu

Research and Training Center on Community Living
Institute on Community Integration (UCEDD)
University of Minnesota, Twin Cities
Driven By Passion

Amy Hewitt

I am driven to rethink what accessibility means

Cliff Poetz

I am driven to professionalize the direct support workforce

John Smith

I am driven to make home ownership a reality for people with disabilities

rtc on community living

ICI
The following slides are provided as a bonus providing additional information and information on workforce solutions.
Workforce development toolkits

• ANCOR
  • DSP Toolkit
  • Tools for Employers
• The Arc of the United States
  • DSP Workforce Toolkit
Changing our messages

Why do DSPs matter – Chumie Twerski

The ultimate goal of Direct Support Professional in the United States – John Raffaele
National Grassroots public awareness

BeFair2Directcare

Facebook

YouTube