



Minnesota Board of Teaching

**Minnesota Department of Education
MDE CC-13
October 9, 2015
Minutes**

Board members present: L. Woelber, J. Baumann, M.F. Clardy, J. Grabowska, LA Stephens, A. Krafthefer, L. Clarkson, E. Azer, D. O'Brien, J. Barnhill, and J. Bellingham

Board members absent: none

I. Call to Order

The October 9, 2015, Minnesota Board of Teaching meeting was called to order by Chair, J. Bellingham, at 9:08 a.m. in Conference Center A, Room 13, at the Minnesota Department of Education. A quorum was present.

II. Business Meeting

- A. Approval of Agenda: J. Grabowska moved approval of the agenda with extreme flexibility. J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.
- B. Consent Agenda: J. Baumann moved to approve the Consent Agenda. J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.
 - 1. Minutes of the September 11, 2015 Meeting
 - 2. Variance and Temporary Limited Appeals - **October 2015 - Permissions Issued**

4th Variances Issued				
School District/Charter School	Teacher Name	Area(s) of Licensure	Licensure Area(s) Requests	% FTE
Minneapolis	Jill Emanuel	EBD, Reading, Physical Ed, DAPE	Health 5-12	1.0
Wayzata	Michelle Jacklitch	Business and Technology	Communication Technology Careers 7-12	.33
Wayzata	Candace Lee	Business	Business 5-12	1.00

4th Variances Issued				
Red Wing	Karin Meyer	Pre K, Early Childhood Special Education, Elementary Education	Sped: EBD K-12	.50
Region 6 & 8 SW/WC Coop	Sherri Citterman	Pre K, Early Childhood Special Education, Elementary Education	Sped: ABS K-12	.33
Maple River	Daniel Vetter	Social Studies	Sped: EBD K-12	1.00
Heron Lake-Okabena	Lisa Thielen	Elementary Education	Sped: ABS K-12	.75
Additional License Issued Based on Basic Skills Testing - 122.A18 Subd 2 (b)				
School District/Charter School	Teacher Name	Licensure Area(s) Requests		
Higher Ground Academy	Engale Beyene	Chemistry 9-12		

3. Waiver Requests

School	Individual	Program
Benson - Care and Treatment Center	Lynn Lundebrek	Experimental Program
"	Eric Ose	Experimental Program
"	Taianna Moe	Experimental Program
Carlton - Chemical Dependency Program	Richard Norton	Experimental Program
E.C.H.O Charter - Project Based Learning	Kay Haneca	Experimental Program
"	Jason Vanengen	Experimental Program
"	Jennifer Keely	Experimental Program
Harbor City International Charter - Service Learning and Vocational Skills	Theodore Anderson	Experimental Program
"	Aryn Bergsven	Experimental Program
"	Darin Bergsven	Experimental Program
"	Gregg Dold	Experimental Program
"	Carol Furchert	Experimental Program
"	Amanda Hexum	Experimental Program
"	Elizabeth Holte	Experimental Program
"	Peter Langr	Experimental Program

School	Individual	Program
"	Emily Lanik Parr	Experimental Program
"	Sarah Lindahl	Experimental Program
"	Thomas Maloney	Experimental Program
"	Brian Scott	Experimental Program
"	Anne Wise	Experimental Program
"	Robert Turner	Experimental Program
"	Ted Buck	Experimental Program
"	Kristofor McNeal	Experimental Program
Hastings - ALC	Brian Schmitz	Experimental Program
"	Kevin Kuechenmeister	Experimental Program
High School for Recording Arts - Project Based Learning	Joseph Cienian	Experimental Program
"	Darryl Young	Experimental Program
"	Barbara Murphy	Experimental Program
"	Dan Frey	Experimental Program
"	Renee Swanson	Experimental Program
"	Tracy Richardson	Experimental Program
"	Abby Rosen	Experimental Program
"	Maureen Foss	Experimental Program
"	Mitchell Johnson	Experimental Program
"	Pamela Aasen	Experimental Program
ISD 287 - ALC and ALP	Ronald Wagar	Experimental Program
"	Kelly Garita	Experimental Program
"	Shalonda Mcalester	Experimental Program
"	Chandra Schwab	Experimental Program
"	Heidi Eschenbach	Experimental Program
Jennings Community Learning Center - Advisor and Community Learning Center Model	Valerie Honey	Experimental Program
"	Sara Segar	Experimental Program
"	Thomas Wendt	Experimental Program
"	William Zimmewicz	Experimental Program
"	Zachary Fjelstad	Experimental Program
Kasson-Matorville - Project Lead the Way	Sharie Furst	Experimental Program
Milaca - ALC	Kyle Shepard	Experimental Program
"	Kimberly Knudsen	Experimental Program
"	Susan Bialka	Experimental Program
"	Steven Hammero	Experimental Program
Minneapolis - Contract Alternative	Marshall Yates	Experimental Program
"	Catherine Flynn	Experimental Program
"	Nicole Wagner	Experimental Program
"	Teresa Thompson	Experimental Program
"	Chad Schroeder	Experimental Program

School	Individual	Program
"	Mitchell Jones	Experimental Program
Minnesota Internship Center - Circle Method	Robert Heise	Experimental Program
"	James Morehouse	Experimental Program
"	Kristin Quinn	Experimental Program
"	Brian Barnes	Experimental Program
Monticello - ALP	Sarah Frost	Experimental Program
"	Amy Luxa	Experimental Program
"	David Reeves	Experimental Program
"	Cynthia Fasching	Experimental Program
Mora - ALC	Karen Felger	Experimental Program
"	Jared Faust	Experimental Program
Mountain Iron-Buhl - Care and Treatment Center	Benjamin Sletten	Experimental Program
"	Michael Kivi	Experimental Program
"	James Plese	Experimental Program
"	Cassandra Rogers	Experimental Program
Nashwauk - Keewatin - ALP	Kari Borgman	Experimental Program
Norman County West - Credit Recovery Program	Pamela Holte	Experimental Program
North Branch - Project Lead the Way	Sam Ferraro	Experimental Program
"	Taylor Essen	Experimental Program
"	Irving Geary	Experimental Program
Northeast Metro 916 - ALC, Care and Treatment Center	Ingrid Erickson	Experimental Program
"	Maggie Anderson	Experimental Program
"	Lynn Grundtner	Experimental Program
"	Ashley Reuvers	Experimental Program
"	Kristie Donahue	Experimental Program
"	Bridget Goulet	Experimental Program
"	Shawn Robinson	Experimental Program
"	Harrison Schmidt	Experimental Program
"	Andrea Anderson	Experimental Program
"	Crystal Tucker	Experimental Program
"	James Fridgen	Experimental Program
"	Alyssa Shelton	Experimental Program
"	Megan Nosworthy	Experimental Program
"	Sarah George	Experimental Program
Northland Learning Center - ALC	Melissa Betzolt	Experimental Program
"	Zachary Swart	Experimental Program
"	Laura Rust	Experimental Program
"	Brenton Fadum	Experimental Program
"	Jennifer Kaufenberg	Experimental Program

School	Individual	Program
"	Lynn Lockhart	Experimental Program
"	Megan Wallis	Experimental Program
"	Adam Nelson	Experimental Program
"	Kristopher Hoffman	Experimental Program
"	August Galloway	Experimental Program
Onamia - Individualized Learning and Care and Treatment Center	Karn Dols	Experimental Program
"	Kristen Mohs	Experimental Program
"	James Stott	Experimental Program
"	Melisa Maxwell	Experimental Program
"	Joan Straw	Experimental Program
Owatonna - Individualized Learning	Valorie Rose	Experimental Program
"	Lisa Beschnett	Experimental Program
Pelican Rapids - ALC	Ashley Schultz	Experimental Program
"	Kathleen Knuteson-Olson	Experimental Program
"	Nadine Brown	Experimental Program
Pine River - Backus - ALC	Lorry Parrish	Experimental Program
"	Donald Moen	Experimental Program
"	Kay Sawyer	Experimental Program
"	Kathryn Wagner	Experimental Program
Red Wing - ALC	Joshua Nelson	Experimental Program
"	Amber Sebo	Experimental Program
Region 6 & 8 SW/WC Service Cooperative - Care and Treatment Center	Eric Ose	Experimental Program
"	Lynn Lundebrek	Experimental Program
"	Taianna Moe	Experimental Program
Richfield - ALC	Pamela Quiram	Experimental Program
River Bend Ed District - ALC	Lee Drogemuller	Experimental Program
"	Christopher Weymann	Experimental Program
"	Kristi Rainwater	Experimental Program
"	Josef Warta	Experimental Program
"	Jennifer Clark	Experimental Program
"	Christopher Bodick	Experimental Program
"	Elizabeth Ness	Experimental Program
Roseau - ALP	Jessica Bordun	Experimental Program
Runestone Area Ed District - ALC	Patrick Stier	Experimental Program
St. Cloud - ALC, Care and Treatment Center	Nathan Jensen	Experimental Program
"	Brandi Lacey	Experimental Program
"	Craig Slocum	Experimental Program
"	Erica Heath	Experimental Program
"	Brandi Richards-Berger	Experimental Program

School	Individual	Program
"	Bret Hansen	Experimental Program
"	Randi Branson	Experimental Program
"	Amanda Dirksen	Experimental Program
"	Jon Leintz	Experimental Program
"	Tara Kline	Experimental Program
St. Louis Park - Care and Treatment Center	Sandra Maw	Experimental Program
Stillwater - ALC	Scott Olson	Experimental Program
"	Jeffrey McGie	Experimental Program
Swanville - ALC	Michelle Peterson	Experimental Program
Technical Academies of Minnesota - Project Based Learning	Sara Baird	Experimental Program
"	Carissa Moreland	Experimental Program
"	Terra Dziengel	Experimental Program
"	Jennifer Euteneuer	Experimental Program
"	Mark Braun	Experimental Program
"	Rhonda Fogelson	Experimental Program
"	Terra Jerde	Experimental Program
"	Michaela Bengtson	Experimental Program
"	Claire Henning	Experimental Program
"	Douglas Knick	Experimental Program
"	Jacob Wittman	Experimental Program
"	Kathleen Brinton	Experimental Program
"	Carl Anderson	Experimental Program
Waseca - ALC	Dawn Skinner	Experimental Program
"	Mandi Nohner	Experimental Program
"	Daniel Sharpsteen	Experimental Program
"	Ann Erickson	Experimental Program
Waubun-Ogema-White Earth -ALP	Pattie Degroat	Experimental Program
"	Levi Tronnes	Experimental Program
"	Diana King	Experimental Program
"	Lee Weigel	Experimental Program
Willmar - Credit Recovery Program , Care and Treatment Center, ALC	Ross Dahl	Experimental Program
"	Bradley Haugen	Experimental Program
"	Claire Hendershott	Experimental Program
"	Michael Leonard	Experimental Program
"	Chad Revier	Experimental Program
"	Douglas Rossum	Experimental Program
"	Teresa Depuydt	Experimental Program
"	Benjamin Panchyshyn	Experimental Program
Zumbro - ALC	Charles Lonergan	Experimental Program

School	Individual	Program
"	Douglas Larsen	Experimental Program
"	Joseph Desannoy	Experimental Program
"	Garret Bitker	Experimental Program
"	Adam Barner	Experimental Program
"	Leila Hess	Experimental Program
Zumbrota-Mazeppa - ALP	Anthony Brown	Experimental Program

4. Institutional Approvals – None
5. Program Approvals
 - a. Request for Initial Program Approval (RIPA):
The Board granted approval to the following programs:

University of Minnesota: Crookston Approval through June 2016

Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.4050	Teachers of Agriculture Education	baccalaureate
8710.4825	Teacher Coordinator of Work Based Learning: Agriculture Education	baccalaureate

Minnesota State University: Moorhead Approval through June 2016

Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.5050	Teachers of Special Education: Academic Behavioral Strategist ENDORSEMENT program for secondary content programs	post baccalaureate

- b. Request for Full Continuing Program Approval (PERCA):

The Board granted approval through June 30, 2017 to the following program(s). Approval beyond June 30, 2017 is contingent on meeting program approval requirements via submitted Program Effectiveness Reports for Continuing Approval (PERCA) due January 1, 2017.

Bethel University

Rule Number	Licensure Area	Program Level
8710.5850	Teachers of Special Education: Autism Spectrum Disorders	Post baccalaureate
8710.5850	Teachers of Special Education: Autism Spectrum Disorders ENDORSEMENT PROGRAM for Academic Behavioral Strategist licensure	Post baccalaureate

- C. Nonlicensed Community Expert Requests
 1. New Nonlicensed Community Experts

GROUP I – Community Experts – First Time/New

School	Individual	Course(s)
Arts and Science Academy	Brianna Forsyth	Academic and Behavioral Strategist K-12

School	Individual	Course(s)
Augsburg Fairview Academy	Kathryn Smith	Math 5-12
Aurora Charter	Gregoria Arita	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
Bdote Learning Center	Bernadette Cisneros	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
Cambridge-Isanti	Travis Fuhol	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
Chisago Lakes	Mary Hischer	Early Childhood Special Education B-Age 6
Cook County	Julie Adams	Elementary Education K-6, Math 5-12, and Physical Education K-12
Frazee-Bergas	Kara Stenger	Early Childhood Education B-Grade 3
Granada Huntley-East Chain	Wendy Johnson	Family and Consumer Sciences 5-12
"	Mirian Vallette	Spanish K-12
Hiawatha Academies	Taylor Williamson	Elementary Education K-6
Higher Ground Academy	Matthew McWilliam	Physical Education K-12
Hmong College Prep Academy	Joanna Klitzke	Learning Disabilities K-12
ISD 287	Brielle Thomas	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
"	Spencer Wirth-Davis	Theatre and Visual Arts K-12
"	Lindsey Proell	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
"	Lauren McGrane	Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12
"	Donald West	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
Lac qui parle Valley	Taylor Flegel	Life Science 9-12
Minneapolis	Ryan Wilsey	Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12
"	Mohamed Ibrahim	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Mehri McLaughlin	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
New Prague	Kayla Kaisershot	Early Childhood Education B-Grade 3
New Ulm	Jennifer Jackson	Early Childhood Education B-Grade 3
Norman County East	Dillon Lundin	Technology 5-12
"	Michael Boman	Agricultural Education 5-12
North Branch	Daniel Forcelle	Technology 5-12
North St. Paul Maplewood Oakdale	Sierra Armien-Funk	Parent and Family Education - Adult
Osseo	Kitrick Myers	Academic and Behavioral Strategist K-12
"	Aubri Lindberg	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
Parkers Prairie	Susan Lyman	Teacher of Computer/KeyBoarding and Related Technology Application 5-8
Perham - Dent	Melissa Bunkowske	Elementary Education K-6
Pierz	Debra St. Sauver	Learning Disabilities and Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
Prior Lake-Savage	Beatriz Martin	Spanish K-12
Region 6 & 8 SW/WC Service Coop	Joeleen Krier	American Sign Language K-12

School	Individual	Course(s)
Richfield	Javier Salmeron Chacon	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
Roseau	Pamela Wenzel	Vocal and Classroom Music K-12
"	Brooke Homstad	Medical Careers 7-12
Rum River Special Education Coop	Mara Koolmo	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
St. Paul	Ian Buck	Communication Technology Careers 7-12
Shakopee	Nancy Sherry	Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12 and Learning Disabilities K-12
South Koochiching	Jennifer Warren	Agricultural Education 5-12
Southern Plains Ed Coop	James Miller	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
Spring Lake Park	Emily Quitney	Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12
STRIDE Academy	Dana Millaway	Teacher of Computer/KeyBoarding and Related Technology Application 5-8
Twin Cities German Immersion Charter	Shelli Streeper	Physical Education K-12
Yinghua Academy	Mengyao Chen	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Sirui Chen	Social Studies 5-8
"	Zhou Yun Li	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Wei Jiang	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Ye Long	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Sierra Riggs	Visual Arts K-12

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve the Group I, First Time/New Community Experts with the exception of: Bdote Learning Center (Cisneros), Cook County (Adams), ISD #287 (Thomas), Minneapolis (Wilsey and McLaughlin), Norman County East (Lundin), Prior Lake-Savage (Martin), Southern Plains Ed Co-op (Miller), Spring Lake Park (Quitney), Yinghua Academy (Riggs). L. Woelber seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve first time community expert Bdote Learning Center (Bernadette Cisneros). J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve first time community expert Cook County (Julie Adams). E. Azer seconded the motion. The motion passed. Heather Ward will provide the Board with clarification.

J. Baumann made a motion to approve first time community expert ISD #287 (Brielle Thomas). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve first time community expert Minneapolis (Ryan Wilsey). J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve first time community expert Minneapolis (Mehri McLaughlin). J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed. M.F. Clardy abstained.

J. Baumann made a motion to approve first time community expert Norman County East (Dillon Lundin). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve first time community expert Prior Lake-Savage (Beatriz Martin),

J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Baumann made a motion to approve first time community expert Southern Plains Ed Coop (James Miller). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve first time community expert Spring Lake Park (Emily Quitney). J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed with a nay vote from L. Clarkson. Heather Ward will provide the Board with clarification.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve first time community expert Yinghua Academy (Sierra Riggs). J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

It was noted that community experts are not subject to background checks through the Minnesota Department of Education, however, school districts do sign off on background checks. And, the Board encourages community expert applicants to enroll in a teacher preparation program. E. Doan reminded Board members that neither an associate degree nor a BA degree are a requirement for community expert approvals.

2. Renewals/Repeats Nonlicensed Community Experts

GROUP II – Community Experts – Renewals/Repeats

School	Individual	Course(s)
Achieve Language Academy	Vue Yang	Hmong Language K-8
Deer River	Douglas Grandia	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
Floodwood	Elisa Cortes-Miho	Spanish K-12
Hmong College Prep Academy	Xiangjum Lu	Chinese Language K-12
"	Cheng Yang	Hmong Language 9-12
ISD 287	Yilin He	Chinese Language K-12
Isle	Linda Schoeck	Parent and Family Education - Adult
Minneapolis	Dinnah Gustavo	Developmental Disabilities K-12
"	Ahmed Abdi	English as a Second Language K-12
"	Vicent Sanchez-Grande	Science 5-8
"	Denise Clarke	Cosmetology 9-12
"	Satomi Olmsted	Japanese Language K-12
"	Heidi Spickler	Learning Disabilities K-12
Minneapolis Academy Charter	Sean Lidberg	Emotional Behavior Disorders K-12
New Discoveries Montessori Academy	Michele Jozwick	Learning Disabilities K-12
"	Rebecca Ewert	Autism Spectrum Disorders B-12
New Ulm	Patricia Mathews	Parent and Family Education - Adult
"	Missy Fluegge	Early Childhood Education B-Grade 3 and Parent and Family Education - Adult
Richfield	Maria Henar Zamacola Feijoo	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
Rochester STEM Academy	Hassan Lahos	Arabic Language K-12
Roseau	Shane Larsen	Technology 5-12 and Construction Careers 7-12
Rosemount Apple Valley Eagan	Ling Wang	Chinese Language K-8

St. Paul City School	Ashley Brown	Elementary Education K-6
South Washington County	Maria Moreno	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
Southwest Metro Education Coop	Paul Lidstone	Construction Careers 7-12
Wabasso	Barbara Johnson	Family and Consumer Sciences 5-12
Yinghua Academy	Chia-Yu Lin	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Sui Ru Seberson	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Fang Wu	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Ye Cheng	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Xu Yang Zhang	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Wenyun Dong	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Yi Li	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Pin-Chen Huang	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Hui-Tzu Wu	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Ai-ai Lin-Johnson	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Shiyn Li	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Vickee Nelson	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
"	Li Chen Lin	Math 5-8
"	Lu Yang	Chinese Language K-8

LA Stephens made a motion to approve Group II – Repeat/Renewal Community Expert requests with the exception of Yinghua Academy (Li Chen Lin). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve Yinghua Academy (Li Chen Lin). J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

There was discussion concerning too many requests for community expert applications, noting some are a 7th year. E. Doan noted that it is not written into statute currently to deny requests after a certain number, but the Board can talk about having the conversation to change this. The Board would like to make districts aware that applicants should work on licensure or enroll in a teacher prep program and that for next year, school districts should not expect automatic approval. School districts need to be aware that they cannot indefinitely staff their schools with community experts. We should consider having the legislature putting a cap/limit on the number of requests to support our decisions especially if there are Board member changes.

Chair Bellingham asked Heather Ward for clarification on the number of special permission requests. With over 270 requests at today's meeting, we now have over 1000 in Minnesota who are not licensed. He added that in the past three years, the Board has investigated community requests

more than ever before with reviewing individual applications. The Board needs to address this concern and owes it to the students to do due diligence. D. O’Brien added that the community expert was established for those to come into a classroom on a short term basis as an adjunct to curriculum. L. Clarkson suggested we also remove the personal aspect on applications and follow a guideline that may need to be established. The current statute provides guidelines, but also gives the Board purview to make changes. This topic will go to the Executive Committee for continued discussion.

D. Discretionary Variance Requests

1. Discretionary Variance Requests

District	Individual	Licensure
Park Rapids	Jennifer Jackson	Medical Careers 9-12 (Medical Terms and CNA courses only)
Richfield	Lastina Jenifer Bates Bena	Early Childhood Education B-grade 3 Immersion (Kindergarten only)
Roseville	Vima Johanna Rivera	Elementary Education K-6 Immersion
South Koochiching	Christine Lundin	Social Studies 5-12 (Psychology 9-12 only)
Woodbury Leadership Academy	Tom Munoz	Science 5-8

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve Jennifer Jackson (Park Rapids). L. Clarkson seconded the motion. The motion passed.

M.F. Clardy made a motion to approve Lastina Jenifer Bates Bena (Richfield). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska made a motion to approve Vima Johanna Rivera (Roseville). M.F. Clardy seconded the motion. The motion passed. E. Azer abstained.

J. Baumann made a motion to approve Christine Lundin (South Koochiching). M.F. Clardy seconded the motion. The motion passed with a nay from J. Grabowska. LA Stephens abstained.

M.F. Clardy made a motion to approve Tom Munoz (Woodbury Leadership Academy). J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

E. Public Comment - Individuals wishing to address the Board must sign up prior to the Call to Order and may speak for 3-5 minutes.

Paul Spies, Professor at Metro State University, shared his comments to point out some data from Metro State regarding the MTLE “Basic” Skills exam, alert the Board to a recent court case, and propose actions moving forward. Mr. Spies conveyed his extreme disappointment that the state’s procurement process led to the recommendation of Pearson continuing as the vendor. ETS Praxis was bad in his view but Pearson MTLE has been worse in terms of widening the race gap between who can get licensed, test prep supports, and customer service. Mr. Spies shared information about a New York based Federal court case involving testing as well as the following recommendations:

1. Maximize flexibility through alternative measures for candidates to prove they know reading, writing and math needed for their job
2. Lower cut scores to truly “basic” proficiency
3. Take and encourage Legislators to take the “Basic” skills exams and publish the results, then

- make sure cut scores are no higher than mean score of policy makers
4. Study the competence of candidates who have been provided provisional licenses because they haven't passed exams in relation to candidates who have passed exams
 5. Support eliminating Pedagogy test and content test as artificial measures of what teachers should know given rigorous MTLE
- Chair Bellingham thanked him for his reporting.

Sara Ford from Education Minnesota presented concern in the area of permissiveness for community experts and waiver requests. Her comments were as follows:

Good morning Board members. My name is Sara Ford, and I am here representing Education Minnesota. Most of you knew my predecessor, Garnet Franklin. I worked for several years at EM on issues related to higher education, and just this past summer moved to our policy and outreach department. It is in that capacity that I conduct research regarding education policy, attend Board meetings and help our members as they navigate licensure matters.

On behalf of our leadership, staff, and many members, I speak to you today to convey our serious concern over the Board's permissiveness regarding requests for community expert waivers that are in some cases clearly abuses of the waiver process and in other cases very likely abuses of the waiver process.

We are very much aware of teacher shortages in some areas of the state and in some licensure areas. We understand why districts in some cases need the flexibility to request waivers to rules when there is no other mechanism by which they might get a licensed teacher in front of their kids. But we also understand that the Board of teaching was first established and is still in existence to make sure that Minnesota's school children are taught by qualified teachers. We also understand that many of the most disadvantaged of Minnesota's school children are the students most likely to be taught by individuals who have not received the preparation necessary to be effective in the classroom.

In the past two months, several BOT members have expressed their own, very similar concerns. Board members have pointed out that districts and charter schools are often not even bothering to carefully complete the waiver request process or to provide all of the requested information. Board members have pointed out that again and again that they are being asked to approve sending some of the least qualified people into the most complex and difficult classrooms special education classrooms. Board members have pointed out that there is no way of knowing whether a potential community expert candidate will ever actually enroll in a teacher preparation program. Board members have expressed concern over community expert requests for positions for which there were licensed teacher applicants, for which there was no job posting, or a job posting for only a day, or for which there has been no effort made to find a licensed teacher even after three years of using the same community expert.

Board members have pointed out hand-written reference letters from family members. Board members have pointed out the fact that some districts wait to request the necessary waivers until the candidate in question is already teaching, thereby putting the BOT in a difficult position of being asked to fix a problem that was of the district's making.

And Board members have wondered out loud how they can send a message to school districts and charter schools to stop taking the waiver process for granted.

But in the last two months of meetings, if my memory serves correctly, the Board has approved all but one of these requests, even when the discussion is focused on the clear or probable abuse of the process on the part of the district or charter school making the request.

I understand that the BOT is put under a great deal of pressure. I understand that the BOT is held out as a scapegoat for all that ails education. In fact I recognize that there are people who come to all of these meetings in order to make sure all of you feel a great deal of pressure to look away from your mission.

122A.25 NONLICENSED COMMUNITY EXPERTS; VARIANCE.

Minnesota statute 122A.25 provides the relevant language on community expert waiver requests. That language gives you the option of allowing “districts and charter schools to hire nonlicensed community experts to teach in the public schools or charter schools on a limited basis according to this section.”

The statute continues: “In approving or disapproving the application for each community expert, the Board shall consider:

- (1) the qualifications of the community person whom the district or charter school proposes to employ;
- (2) the reasons for the need for a variance from the teacher licensure requirements;
- (3) the district’s efforts to obtain licensed teachers, who are acceptable to the school Board, for the particular course or subject area or the charter school’s efforts to obtain licensed teachers for the particular course or subject area;
- (4) the amount of teaching time for which the community expert would be hired;
- (5) the extent to which the district or charter school is utilizing other nonlicensed community experts under this section;
- (6) the nature of the community expert’s proposed teaching responsibility; and
- (7) the proposed level of compensation to the community expert.

But nowhere does it say that you **MUST** approve a request. To the contrary, the statute gives you the ability to deny a request when any of these factors raises a red flag. In some of the cases you have discussed, the majority of these factors weigh strongly against approval, yet they are still being approved. In our view, you have not only the ability, but an obligation to deny a community expert request when the majority of these factors weigh against approval.

Minnesota’s students right now are being taught by more than 700 non-licensed teachers, and none of us who’ve spent any time in this room can honestly say that high number is exclusively the result of our teacher shortage. Minnesota’s students are being taught by non-licensed staff in positions for which there is no shortage and for which multiple licensed teachers have applied, in some cases multiple times. Students are being taught by non-licensed staff in positions for which no sincere effort whatsoever has been made to find licensed candidates. Most stakeholders want districts and charter schools to do due diligence when seeking community expert waivers, and in many, many cases, they do. But the Board’s near-blanket approval process in cases that indicate abuse of the waiver process runs contrary to this desire.

Minnesota’s teachers overwhelmingly believe that their licenses matter. They matter because they are based on rules and content standards developed by this Board to ensure that all teachers in a given area have the same baseline of knowledge to be successful. Our members are **PROUD** of their teaching licenses, not only because of the preparation required to earn them, but because they know that this training and experience has a direct impact on the quality of the education their students receive. We appreciate the concerns so many of you have expressed at the last few meetings. And we hope very much that you act on those concerns as you continue in the business of making sure the teachers in front of our students are indeed the most qualified for that important, precious work.

She thanked the Board for the opportunity and Chair Bellingham thanked her.

Cyndy Crist, MACTE Legislative and Policy Liaison, presented the MACTE Minute regarding the Board of Teaching’s Standards and Rules Advisory Committee. She commended the Board for reconvening this committee to work with various stakeholders on critical issues:

1. Alignment of the Standards of Effective Practice to the new INSTASC standards
2. Review of content standards with the goals of parity and streamlining
3. Out-of-state licensure issues
4. State partnership with CAEP
5. Testing and edTPA for teacher candidates

6. K-12 student achievement

Chair Bellingham thanked her for her report and issued a 10 minute recess at 10:22 a.m.

III. Unfinished Business

A. Board of Teaching Adopted Skills Exam Requirement

E. Doan reported we have been talking about the skills exam for a number of weeks with various options from a variety of stakeholders, and a list of resources was distributed after the last meeting.

Discussion on the basic skills exam included Board members in agreement to remove the roadblock or barriers for candidates who successfully complete teacher preparation programs, the edTPA process, pedagogical tests, by revising the basic skills level exam to college and career ready. The exam needs to be “basic” rather than at the college experience level which is prohibitive for some candidates to pass during their sophomore year, including those with equity disparities, and should not override experience and competence. Of equal concern is *when* candidates should take the test. If they complete their major and then fail the test, it’s very costly after 4 years of tuition. It was suggested that instituting the test at an earlier point in their college career may be a better option.

Jim Barnhill moved that the BOT require passing scores for basic skills measures to be set at the level of College and Career Readiness. And, that the Board of Teaching adopt the following exams as a measure of reading, writing and mathematics skills, as required by MN statute 122A.09 and 122A.18 With passing scores to be determined by July 1, 2016 for all measures:

- National Evaluation Series (Pearson Skills Exam)
- ACT Plus Writing
- SAT (including writing)
- GRE
- Praxis 1 (ETS Skills Exam)
- MTLE

J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed. J. Barnhill invited members of the public to comment at the November meeting when the test should be taken.

IV. New Business

A. Rulemaking – Discussion continued in afternoon work session: 8710.0300 – 8710.0500

E. Doan stated that following the meeting, the Board will have a conversation in the afternoon work session regarding the 8710.0400 rule that addresses licensure from candidates from other states. We have a mandate from the legislature to enter into rule making and need a formal resolution to enter into this process. This conversation will be open to the public. The purpose of the resolution is to formally launch the process.

J. Barnhill made a motion to adopt the resolution: **RULEMAKING REGARDING REQUIREMENTS FOR THE ISSUANCE, RENEWAL AND VALIDITY OF TEACHING LICENSES**

WHEREAS, Minnesota Statute 122A.09 requires the Board of Teaching to adopt rules by January 1, 2016, to license applicants under sections [122A.23](#) and [122A.245](#) permitting applicants to demonstrate their qualifications through the Board's recognition of a teaching license from another state and criteria for determining a "similar content field" and "similar licensure area."; and

WHEREAS, MN§ 122A.09 Subd. 9 gives the Board authority to adopt rules subject to the provisions of chapter 14 to implement sections 122A.05 to 122A.09, 122A.16, 122A.17, 122A.18, 122A.20, 122A.21, and 122A.23; and

WHEREAS, the current requirements of Minnesota Rule 8710.0300, 8710.0400 and 8710.0500 address the requirements for the issuance, renewal and validity of teaching licenses;

THEREFORE, The Executive Director of the Board of Teaching is authorized and directed to sign and to give the Notice of the Board's Intent to Adopt Rules following a hearing.

The Executive Director must give this notice to all persons who have registered their names with the Board for that purpose. The Executive Director must also publish the Notice in the State Register. Furthermore, the Executive Director is authorized and directed to do anything else needed to complete this Notice.

The Executive Director of the Board of Teaching is authorized and directed to act as the Board's representative at hearing and do anything else needed to adopt these rules with a hearing. This includes authority to sign the Order Adopting Rules if there are no modifications to the rules other than modifications approved by the Board.

J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed.

V. Reports

A. Minnesota Department of Education

Nels Onstad, the new Executive Director of Educator Licensing introduced himself. He was a former teacher and coach in NW Minnesota and served many years as a principal in the West Central area of Minnesota. Chair Bellingham welcomed him to the Minnesota Department of Education.

B. Staff

E. Doan provided updates stating we have just completed an edTPA summit at St. Cloud University on October 7th and thanked Alex Liuzzi for his work coordinating the event. Several areas for improvement throughout several sessions including P12 partnerships, faculty orientation to edTPA, local evaluation training, back mapping, continuing analysis and being closer to seeing improvements in our programs. She thanked St. Cloud staff and all individuals who participated; it was a great event. Board members are invited to attend the edTPA summit in the future.

NASDTEC Central region recently discussed the teacher shortage issues that are now present everywhere. Oklahoma has the worst situation in history with a record number of emergency credentials in place. North Dakota recently adopted a new form of special permission, community expert permissions. Iowa is looking at resources for implementation of services, including a \$600K appropriation to allow an online system that matches licensed candidates to job openings. This is a cutting edge system that other states are watching. They are also looking at a larger percent of licensing fees appropriated for operations and interstate agreements. Wisconsin has now received offer from a Midwest comprehensive center to offer assistance with help to put together an agreement for licensure. The teacher shortage conversation will continue at the NASDTEC conference in Atlanta next week.

C. Chair

Judy Randall from the Office of the Legislative Auditor addressed the Board. She thanked Board members who have completed the survey questions and reminded the 3 remaining members to please do so. She will resend the email request if needed. Chair Bellingham thanked her and all BOT staff members for their hard work.

At 11:04, J. Grabowska made a motion to go into closed session. J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

VI. Closed Session for Licensure Matters

In the matter of the licensure renewal application of David Gregoire:

David Gregoire, licensee, pro se

Michele Owen, assistant attorney with the Attorney General's Office advising attorney to the Board.

Nathan Hartshorn, assistant attorney with the Attorney General's Office representing the Board's Discipline Committee.

Ms. Owen provided a brief explanation outlining the process.

J. Grabowska made a motion to appoint Dr. L. Clarkson as acting chair. M.F. Clardy seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Michele referred to a typographical error on page 7 of the Proposed Findings of Fact Conclusions of Law and Order, Item 3 a: should read "not to renew."

Mr. Hartshorn and Mr. Gregoire made 15 minute presentations to the Board and then left the room during Board deliberations.

E. Azer moved that the Board adopt the Findings of Fact Conclusions of Law and Order in the matter of licensure application of David E. Gregoire as recommended by the Disciplinary Committee and that the Acting Chairperson be authorized to sign the Order on behalf of the Board of Teaching. M.F. Clardy seconded the motion.

The Board entered into a period of deliberation and discussion.

E. Azer made an Amendment to her original motion and moved that the Board adopt the Findings of Fact Conclusions of Law and Order in the matter of licensure application of David E. Gregoire and that the teaching licensure application of Mr. Gregoire be denied for a period of 10 years starting with the date of the signed order and that the Acting Chairperson be authorized to sign on behalf of the Board of Teaching. M.F. Clardy seconded the motion. The motion to the amendment for Mr. Gregoire to not teach for 10 year failed.

Results of the vote on the amended motion:

A. Krafthefer – abstain
L. Woelber – nay
J. Grabowska - nay
M. F. Clardy – aye
E. Azer-- aye
J. Bauman – nay
LA. Stephens – abstain
J. Grabowska – nay
J. Bellingham – abstain
L. Clarkson – aye
J. Barnhill-nay
Aye – 3
Abstain - 3
Nay – 5

E. Azer reread the original motion. The motion passed.

Results of the vote on the original motion:

A. Krafthefer -- abstain
L. Woelber – aye
J. Grabowska – nay
M. F. Clardy – aye
J. Bellingham – abstain
E. Azer – aye
J. Bauman – aye
LA. Stephens – abstain
L. Clarkson – aye

J. Barnhill-nay
Aye – 5
Abstain -3
Nay – 2

Other Licensure Matters:

E. Azer made a motion that the Board adopt the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Order revoking the developmental disabilities license of Doreen Mett. J. Grabowska seconded the motion. The motion passed with M.F. Clardy, J. Bellingham and A. Krafthefer abstaining.

E. Azer made a motion to return to Chair Bellingham as acting chair. L. Woelber seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska moved that the Board of Teaching approve the Findings of Fact Conclusions of Law and Order denying the licensure application of James Edward Norman. J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Grabowska moved that the Board of Teaching approve the Stipulation Agreement and Consent Order between Andrew Scott Hasty and the Board of Teaching permanently revoking Mr. Hasty's licenses. M.F. Clardy seconded the motion. The motion passed.

J. Baumann moved the Board return to open session. L. Clarkson seconded the motion. The motion passed.

At 1:19 p.m. Chair Bellingham stated the due to the length of time in closed session, the afternoon work session would be abbreviated. E. Doan provided a brief overview regarding the rulemaking process. It was noted that information to Board members would be forthcoming via email.

VII. Adjourn

J. Grabowska made a motion to adjourn the meeting. J. Baumann seconded the motion. The motion passed. The meeting ended at 1:20 p.m. Following the meeting, the Board continued with a work session on the rulemaking process. E. Doan provided guidelines on what is needed by reviewing the rules, and suggested starting at the beginning.

Respectfully submitted,

Lori Rosenthal, Recorder

Next meeting: Friday, November 13, 2015 at 9:00 a.m., MDE Conference Center A – Room 13