

David Birkholz

From: Doni Murphy [dlmurphy@nrg-llc.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 04, 2009 12:06 PM
To: David.Birkholz@state.mn.us
Cc: 'Lahr, Darrin F'
Subject: Monticello to St. Cloud CATF Route/Segment/Alignment Comparison
Attachments: _XCL_CAPX_CATF Proposed Routes and Alignment_20090804.pdf; Comparison of Alignment Proposed by CATF_20090804.pdf; Comparison of CATF Route Segment Alternatives_20090804.pdf; Comparison of CATF Routes_20090804.pdf

Mr. Birkholz

Attached is a map of what we have interpreted as the alternative substation sites, routes, route segment alternatives, or alignment identified by the CATF groups. Our interpretation is based on review of the hardcopy maps and notes, as modified or prepared by the CATF groups.

We have prepared a quantitative comparison table for the CATF routes, as compared to the routes proposed in the Route Permit Application. For the purposes of this comparison, CATF routes were defined as 1,000-foot corridors.

We have also prepared a quantitative comparison table for the CATF route segment alternatives, as compared to comparable portions of the routes proposed in the Route Permit Application. For the purposes of this comparison, CATF routes were defined as 1,000-foot corridors.

Finally, we analyzed the CATF alignment as varying offsets from the interstate right-of-way, utilizing the same methodology as was used for the assessment of alignments within the Route Permit Application.

The table columns in each respective table are color-coded to match the alignment, route segment alternatives, or routes identified by either the Applicant or the CATF and as depicted on the attached map.

Please let us know if any questions.

Thanks.
Doni Murphy



Doni Murphy, CPM
dlmurphy@nrg-llc.com
222 S Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Chicago, IL 60606
(312) 239-1494 Direct
(312) 519-3647 Cell
(612) 347-6780 Fax

**CapX Monticello to St. Cloud 345 kV Transmission Line Project
Community Advisory Task Force (CATF)
Comparison of Alignment Proposed by CATF**

		Alignment Comparison of Group #1 Alignment		
		Maximum Interstate Corridor Sharing Alignment	Minimum Interstate Corridor Sharing Alignment (Group #1 Proposed Alignment)	No Interstate Corridor Sharing Alignment
	Length (miles)	1.7	1.7	2.3
	Acres	30	30	42
	Length of ROW Paralleling Existing Rights-of-Way (miles)	1.7	1.7	1.9
	Percent of ROW Paralleling Existing Rights-of-Way	100%	100%	83%
Residences and Non-Residential Buildings	Residences 0 - 75 feet from Alignment (count)	0	0	0
	Residences 75 - 150 feet from Alignment (count)	0	0	1
	Residences 150 - 300 feet from Alignment (count)	0	0	4
	Residences 300 - 500 feet from Alignment (count)	0	0	5
	Residences 0 - 500 feet from Alignment (count)	0	0	9
	Residences 0 - 500 feet from Alignment per Mile (count)	0	0	3.9
	Non-Residential Buildings within ROW (count)	10	0	0
Agricultural	Agricultural Land Use and/or Zoning (acres)	22	30	42
	Agricultural Land Use and/or Zoning (percent of ROW area)	73.4%	96.9%	99.6%
	Center Pivots Within ROW Area (count)	0	0	0
Environmental	BWSR RIM Easements Within ROW Area (acreage)	0	0	0
	BWSR RIM Easements (percent of ROW area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance Within ROW Area (acres, all levels)	0	0	0
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance (percent of ROW area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance within ROW Area (count, all levels)	0	0	0
	MDNR Wildlife Management Areas Within ROW Area (acres)	0	0	0
	MDNR Wildlife Management Areas (percent of ROW area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	State Wild and Scenic River District Within ROW Area (acres)	0	0	0
	State Wild and Scenic River District (percent of ROW area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	Stream Crossings Within ROW Area (count)	1	1	1
	Trout Stream Crossings Within ROW Area (count)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	Wetlands, Includes Lakes Within ROW Area (acres)	1	2	0
	Wetlands, Includes (percent of ROW area)	4.0%	5.3%	0.0%
	Wooded Area Within ROW Area (acres)	1	2	2
Wooded Area (percent of ROW area)	4.6%	8.1%	4.8%	
Other	Aggregate Sources Within ROW Area (count)	0	0	0
	Airports Within ROW Area (count)	0	0	0
	Antenna Structures Within ROW Area (count)	0	0	0
	Cemeteries Within ROW Area (count)	0	0	0
	Churches Within ROW Area (count)	0	0	0
	Daycares Within ROW Area (count)	0	0	0
	Recreational / Open Space / Park Land Use and/or Zoning Within ROW Area (acres)	0	1	0
	Recreational / Open Space / Park Land Use and/or Zoning (percent of ROW area)	1.5%	2.3%	0.0%
	Scenic Byways, Parallels or Crosses ROW Area (presence)	No	No	Yes
	Archaeological Sites Within ROW (count)	0	0	0
	Historical Sites Within ROW (count)	0	0	0

**CapX Monticello to St. Cloud 345 kV Transmission Line Project
Community Advisory Task Force (CATF)**

Comparison of Route Segment Alternatives Proposed by CATF and Comparable Route Segments Proposed by Applicant

		Route Proposed by Applicant		Route Segment Alternative Proposed By Community Advisory Task Force Group	
		Group #3 Alternate 1 Comparable Portion of Alternate Route B	Group #3 Alternate 2 Comparable Portion of Alternate Route B	Group #3	
				Alternate 1	Alternate 2
	Length (miles)	3.3	6.5	5.3	6.5
	Acres	799	414	654	800
	Length of Route Paralleling Existing Rights-of-Way (miles)	2.2	4.5	2.5	6.5
	Percent of Route Paralleling Existing Rights-of-Way	65.2%	69.7%	47.4%	99.9%
Residences and Non-Residential Buildings	Residences (count)	23	8	8	50
	Residences per Mile (count)	7.00	1.20	1.50	7.70
	Non-Residential Buildings (count)	30	14	24	57
	Non-Residential Buildings per Mile (count)	9.00	2.20	4.50	8.80
Agricultural	Agricultural Land Use and/or Zoning (acres)	785	414	565	647
	Agricultural Land Use and/or Zoning (percent of route area)	1	1	1	1
	Center Pivots Within Route Area (count)	400.0%	300.0%	400.0%	0.0%
Environmental	BWSR RIM Easements (acreage)	0	0	0	11
	BWSR RIM Easements (percent of route area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	1.4%
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance within Route Area (acres, all levels)	7	7	46	25
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance (percent of route area, all levels)	0.9%	1.7%	7.0%	3.2%
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance (count, all levels)	1	1	1	1
	MDNR Wildlife Management Areas (acres)	0	0	0	0
	MDNR Wildlife Management Areas (percent of route area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	State Wild and Scenic River District (acres)	0	0	530	0
	State Wild and Scenic River District (percent of route area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.1%	0.0%
	Stream Crossings (count)	1	0	0	1
	Trout Stream Crossings (count)	0	0	0	0
	Wetlands, Includes Lakes (acres)	103	40	19	91
	Wetlands, Includes Lakes (percent of route area)	12.9%	9.6%	2.9%	11.3%
	Wooded Area (acres)	139	77	127	134
Wooded Areas (percent of route area)	17.4%	18.5%	19.4%	16.8%	
Other	Aggregate Sources Within Route Area (count)	0	0	0	0
	Airports Within Route Area (count)	0	0	0	0
	Antenna Structures Within Route Area (count)	1	1	0	0
	Cemeteries Within Route Area (count)	0	0	0	0
	Churches Within Route Area (count)	0	0	0	1
	Daycares Within Route Area (count)	0	0	1	0
	Recreational / Open Space / Park Land Use and/or Zoning (acres)	0	0	48	0
	Recreational / Open Space / Park Land Use and/or Zoning (percent of route area)	0.0%	0.0%	7.4%	0.0%
	Scenic Byways, Parallels or Crosses (presence)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Archaeological Sites Within Route Area (count)	0	0	0	0
	Historical Sites Within Route Area (count)	0	0	0	0

**CapX Monticello to St. Cloud 345 kV Transmission Line Project
Community Advisory Task Force (CATF)
Comparison of Routes Proposed by CATF and Routes Proposed by Applicant**

		Routes Proposed By Applicant			Routes Proposed by Community Advisory Task Force Groups			
		Preferred Route	Alternate Route A	Alternate Route B	Group #2	Group #3	Group #4	
					Alternate 1	Alternate 3	Alternate 1	Alternate 2
	Length (miles)	28.3	32.3	34.7	39.6	29.9	35.5	33.1
	Acres	4,572	4,800	4,605	4,815	4,146	4,357	4,022
	Length of Route Paralleling Existing Rights-of-Way (miles)	26.2	21.3	20.8	30.2	20.1	32.1	27.5
	Percent of Route Paralleling Existing Rights-of-Way	92.6%	70.0%	60.0%	76.3%	67.2%	90.4%	83.1%
Residences and Non-Residential Buildings	Residences (count)	107	106	118	162	47	89	106
	Residences per Mile (count)	3.9	3.3	3.5	4.1	1.6	2.5	3.2
	Non-Residential Buildings (count)	99	219	201	149	62	121	167
	Non-Residential Buildings per Mile (count)	3.5	6.6	5.8	3.8	2.1	3.4	5.0
Agricultural	Agriculture Land Use and/or Zoning (acres)	3,647	4,277	4,136	3,921	3,302	3,519	2,912
	Agriculture Land Use and/or Zoning (percent of route area)	79.8%	89.1%	89.8%	81.4%	79.6%	80.8%	72.4%
	Center Pivots Within Route Area (count)	4	9	11	23	39	31	35
Environmental	BWSR RIM Easements (acreage)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	BWSR RIM Easements (percent of route area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance (acres, all levels)	118	93	97	84	53	86	47
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance (percent of route area, all levels)	2.6%	1.9%	2.1%	1.7%	1.3%	2.0%	1.2%
	MCBS Sites of Biodiversity Significance within Route Area (count, all levels)	12	14	12	12	8	14	6
	MDNR Wildlife Management Areas (acres)	0	0	2	0	0	0	0
	MDNR Wildlife Management Areas (percent of route area)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	State Wild and Scenic River District (acres)	155	93	28	139	251	239	239
	State Wild and Scenic River District (percent of route area)	3.4%	1.9%	0.6%	2.9%	6.1%	5.5%	5.9%
	Stream Crossings (count)	12	16	16	25	15	20	10
	Trout Stream Crossings (count)	1	6	6	3	6	1	1
	Wetlands, Includes Lakes (acres)	570	544	600	955	460	794	389
	Wetlands, Includes Lakes (percent of route area)	12.5%	11.3%	13.0%	19.8%	11.1%	18.2%	9.7%
	Wooded Areas (acres)	432	529	647	859	456	705	419
Wooded Areas (percent of route area)	9.4%	11.0%	14.0%	17.8%	11.0%	16.2%	10.4%	
Other	Aggregate Sources Within Route Area (count)	1	1	0	0	0	0	0
	Airports Within Route Area (count)	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
	Antenna Structures Within Route Area (count)	3	3	1	2	0	1	0
	Cemeteries Within Route Area (count)	2	3	0	0	0	0	0
	Churches Within Route Area (count)	0	1	1	0	0	0	0
	Daycares Within Route Area (count)	0	1	1	1	1	0	4
	Recreational / Open Space / Park Land Use and/or Zoning (acres)	165	130	69	124	214	151	157
	Recreational / Open Space / Park Land Use and/or Zoning (percent of route area)	3.6%	2.7%	1.5%	2.6%	5.2%	3.5%	3.9%
	Scenic Byways, Parallels or Crosses (presence)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Archaeological Sites Within Route Area (count)	4	3	1	2	1	2	2
	Historical Sites Within Route Area (count)	0	4	2	1	0	1	10